

Report for: Cabinet – 11 July 2023

Title: Interim review of Haringey Phase 1 Low Traffic Neighbourhoods (LTNs)

Report authorised by: Barry Francis, Director of Environment and Resident Experience

Lead Officer: Simi Shah, Group Engineer Traffic & Parking
Alex Djan, Streets for People Programme Manager

Ward(s) affected: Bruce Castle, Tottenham Central, West Green, St Ann's, Seven Sisters, Bounds Green, Woodside

**Report for Key/
Non-Key Decision:** Key decision

1 Describe the issue under consideration

- 1.1 This report is an interim review of three trial Low Traffic Neighbourhoods (LTNs) implemented in 2022.
- 1.2 In December 2021, Cabinet approved an 18-month trial of Bounds Green LTN, St Ann's LTN and Bruce Grove West Green LTN, and a range of complementary measures including new pedestrian crossings, cycle hangars and six trial School Streets.
- 1.3 The LTNs were introduced on a trial basis, using Experimental Traffic Orders (ETOs), the very purpose of which is to allow all stakeholders to see the scheme in operation allowing time to reflect on whether the scheme was working and delivering what it was expected to before taking a decision on whether to make alterations, revoke the ETO or make the changes permanent.
- 1.4 The aims of these schemes are primarily to reduce traffic, particularly in residential areas, improve relative air quality, tackle the climate emergency and reduce the risk of road traffic collisions. In addition to this, the schemes are also designed to reduce unnecessary inter-borough car journeys and encourage increased levels of walking and cycling, improving health.
- 1.5 The December 2021 Cabinet report explained that a Monitoring Strategy would be implemented before and during the trial; this is detailed in the:
 - [Bruce Grove West Green Monitoring Strategy](#)
 - [St Ann's LTN Monitoring Strategy](#)
 - [Bounds Green LTN Monitoring Strategy](#)
- 1.6 The purpose of conducting an interim review is to better understand the impacts of the schemes at an early stage through analysis of some of the metrics mentioned

in the monitoring strategies. This includes available quantitative data including traffic counts, air quality monitoring outputs and vehicle movements alongside qualitative data gained following an extensive engagement exercise with stakeholders including residents, businesses, emergency services and Transport for London (TfL) Buses.

- 1.7 Whilst the schemes are in their early stages and some data sets are limited in availability, the review provides an insight into the lived experience of road users since the introduction of the ETOs and enable any identified possible improvements to be considered and trialled as part of an experiment.
- 1.8 The outputs from the interim review are detailed in the Monitoring Data (Appendix A1, A2 and A3), Feedback (Appendix B1, B2 and B3), Business Perception Survey (Appendix C) and Footfall and Mastercard Spend Data (Appendix D). These are summarised in the respective section of this report, as follows:
 - Section 7 – Interim review of Bruce Grove West Green LTN
 - Section 8 - Interim review of St Ann's LTN
 - Section 9 - Interim review of Bruce Grove West Green LTN
- 1.9 Motor traffic: Early indications suggest that there has been a reduction of motor traffic levels on roads inside the LTNs, suggesting that non-local traffic is no longer travelling through the residential streets. Conversely, there has been an increase of traffic on boundary roads since the inception of the schemes although not to the extent initially anticipated through the transport assessment undertaken and reported to Cabinet in 2021. There are exceptions to both and details of changes in motor traffic levels for individual roads are shown for all three LTNs within Appendices A1, A2 and A3. It is important to note that post LTN traffic data was captured in January 2023. This is almost six months and was captured during the initial bedding-in period and therefore over the next six months, we would expect to see further improvements.
- 1.10 Air Quality: Air quality has been measured for the LTN areas since June 2021 and data is only available at this stage to January 2023. This means that making comparisons between short periods of time before and after scheme implementation is unlikely to yield meaningful results; therefore the overall trend of NO₂ levels (as an average across all sites) has been considered to show how air quality has changed over time and how these compare against long term boroughwide monitoring sites.
- 1.11 The data analysed which is limited (summarised in Sections 7,8, and 9 with more detail provided in Appendix A1, A2 and A3) suggests that although NO₂ levels have increased in the LTN areas post their implementation, they have increased at a much lower percentage than the increase seen boroughwide in non LTN areas. This is against a backdrop of worsening air quality levels across the capital post Covid-19 lockdown.
- 1.12 This would indicate that all three LTNs are starting to deliver the intended objective of improving the local Air Quality, and that without the implementation of the LTNs

it is highly likely that the concentrations of NO₂ would be comparable to that of the background sites, i.e. would be higher.

- 1.13 At the end of 2023 when a full year's results are available post LTN implementation, accurate annualised and bias adjusted data will provide a more accurate indication of air quality performance for the LTNs. This full picture will be provided when the final review is undertaken.
- 1.14 Collisions: At this stage there is not enough available data to consider the impacts of the LTNs in respect of road traffic collisions, however this will be reviewed and assessed as the schemes mature and reported on at the final review stage.
- 1.15 High Street Mastercard Spend: This is clearly an area that would have been affected by a number of factors including Covid-19 and cost of living. It is encouraging to see that an analysis of Mastercard spend data and shopping area footfall levels for high streets considered within LTNs (and their boundary roads) and compared them to other similar high streets away from LTNs indicate that they are all following the same trend, so no negative impact due to the LTNs.
- 1.16 Bus journey times: Liaison with TfL buses commenced before the trial schemes went in, with monitoring undertaken of journey time for buses travelling along a number of boundary roads and other key corridors.
- 1.17 This monitoring shows that bus journeys were impacted immediately following the trial schemes going in. Over time, some corridors have recovered, and journey times have returned to normal levels, however some corridors have shown an improvement, but are still experiencing delays. One such corridor is West Green Road which, following site observations, liaison with TfL officers (including bus drivers) has led to consideration of removal of parking places at key locations along the corridor where two-way bus movements are impacted. These options are being developed and will undergo engagement with affected businesses before arriving at recommendations which will be subject to a separate decision.
- 1.18 Officers are working with TfL to improve the operation of the signal junction at Belmont Road and West Green Road and these, together with any parking changes taken forward, will mitigate delays experienced by buses. Joint monitoring of these corridors will continue and the final review will report on the latest data at that time.
- 1.19 Crime and Anti-Social behaviour: Crime data gathered post LTNs shows no indication that crime patterns within the LTN areas have changed following the scheme's introduction. The number of criminal activity reports in the scheme area and in the borough-at-large are broadly similar, both before and after the scheme's introduction. Monitoring of recorded crime will continue to see if any changes are reflected over time.
- 1.20 Emergency services feedback: Impact on emergency services has been raised as a concern, so it's reassuring to know that no issues with emergency response times and service delivery have been highlighted by any of the three main emergency services: Police, Fire and Ambulance. Officers have liaised with

emergency services throughout the engagement phase of the three schemes which helped inform the Cabinet decision in December 2021. This included altering some restrictions from physically closed to camera enforced, allowing these services access through the majority of restrictions. Liaison has been ongoing and the latest feedback received was positive of the way Haringey Council has engaged with emergency services and responded to their concerns.

- 1.21 Throughout the engagement exercise Council Officers have worked with sector professionals to consider the views of stakeholders, including residents living both inside and outside LTN areas, and have reflected on feedback received to identify if there are any opportunities to improve the schemes without compromising the integrity of the desired outcomes. This includes consideration of formal objections raised to the existing ETOs, the feedback from the online survey undertaken via Commonplace and finally the feedback from businesses received as part of the Business Perception survey.
- 1.22 All of this has led to the recommendations made in the report to allow additional access/egress points by opening some of the filters in the Bruce Grove West Green LTN, restrict Heavy Goods Vehicles on Belmont Road/Downhills Way and, in St Anns LTN, the recommendation is to move a traffic filter a short distance to address safety concerns resulting from illegal and dangerous manoeuvres by some drivers.
- 1.23 Additionally, there are recommendations to introduce a universal exemption for residents who are also blue badge holders as well as an additional exemption for Special Educational Needs and Disabilities Passenger Transport provision in the borough. The latter two are to be considered by the Council's Cabinet in a separate but related report.
- 1.24 Any changes that are approved would be introduced under new Experimental Traffic Orders (ETOs) which would trigger a further six-month statutory objection period during which any person may object to the making of an order for the purpose of indefinite continuation of the provision of the ETOs.
- 1.25 This report considers the physical design of each LTN. Subject to approval, the new ETOs, separate for each LTN, will replicate what is in the current ETO for that scheme but with the changes approved for traffic restrictions, parking and loading, and exemptions. These new ETOs will replace the current ETOs which will then cease to be in effect when the new ETOs come into effect.
- 1.26 It is important to note the LTNs have not yet been assessed (and could not have been assessed) with the changes now being proposed and that the ETOs as now proposed would be a genuine and novel experiment.
- 1.27 Before the end of the new ETO expiration period (maximum 18 months), a report with full monitoring information and analysis of all the metrics will be brought to Cabinet with recommendations on whether to revoke the LTNs or make them permanent, the latter through indefinite continuation of the provisions of the ETOs.

2 Cabinet Member Introduction

- 2.1 Our low traffic neighbourhoods are designed to create streets for people, part of our ambition to create a fairer, greener borough. They try to do three big things – reduce the overall volume of traffic, pollution and road danger (among other benefits). The early results from Haringey's LTNs show that they are beginning to do that.
- 2.2 The implementation of Low Traffic Neighbourhood schemes in St. Ann's, Bruce Grove West Green, and Bounds Green has been underway for several months now and it is an opportune time to reflect on their initial impact. The data used in this report was collected approximately five months ago, providing very early assessment of the schemes based on only a few months' worth of data.
- 2.3 Despite the limited timeframe and, in the case of Bruce Grove West Green, only two months after implementation, the trends observed at that point showed positive results, indicating that the LTNs were beginning to deliver on their intended aims. I think we can all remember the disruption of the first few months and most people I speak to acknowledge a marked improvement since then. It is hoped and expected that these positive trends will continue to improve over time.
- 2.4 The report outlines how St. Ann's LTN has demonstrated effective interim outcomes by reducing motorised traffic volumes on internal roads, whilst having minimal impact on most boundary roads, apart from some key locations, which I will touch on later in this introduction. Internal roads experienced a significant decrease in traffic counts, with a reduction of approximately 55%, or around 35,000 fewer vehicles counted. In contrast, boundary roads witnessed an increase of about 6% or around 9,600 additional vehicles counted. Whilst figures do include instances where vehicles journeys on internal LTN streets and on boundary roads have been counted multiple times, it does show the magnitude and direction of change.
- 2.5 The Bruce Grove West Green LTN has also demonstrated positive outcomes, with a notable reduction in motorised traffic volumes on internal roads and a relatively small increase on most boundary roads when considered against pre-LTN predictions. Internal roads witnessed a 51% drop is, equivalent to around 43,600 fewer vehicles. On the other hand, boundary roads experienced a 7% increase, resulting in approximately 17,600 additional vehicles. Whilst figures do include instances where vehicles journeys on internal LTN streets and on boundary roads have been counted multiple times, it does show the magnitude and direction of change. This is typical for an LTN at this stage and lower than some of our projections. To help reduce congestion further we are considering some changes to parking on West Green Rd where the road is narrow and buses can get stuck; these changes will be subject to a separate decision. Considering that the January counts were captured just 2 months after the Bruce Grove West Green LTN was implemented, this reveals an incredibly rapid change.
- 2.6 The Bounds Green LTN has been successful in reducing motorised traffic volumes on internal roads without significant impact on boundary roads. Internal roads

experienced an impressive 66% drop in traffic counts, totalling approximately 15,915 fewer vehicles. Boundary roads witnessed a modest 7% increase, resulting in around 6,834 additional vehicles with some boundary roads seeing a slight reduction in pre-LTN volumes. Whilst figures do include instances where vehicles journeys on internal LTN streets and on boundary roads have been counted multiple times, it does show the magnitude and direction of change – which is very encouraging.

- 2.7 While boundary roads exhibited mixed results across all schemes in this early count, with some experiencing increases and others witnessing decreases in traffic volumes or reductions back to pre-scheme levels, continued monitoring is essential to understand and address any issues. Most LTNs see traffic on boundary roads reduce over time – and the early data for Haringey’s LTNs suggests the same pattern here. As with most traffic management schemes, it can take longer for behaviours to change on some routes than others.
- 2.8 It is worth adding that according to the December 2021 Cabinet report, traffic was predicted to significantly increase on some boundary roads due to the schemes, appreciating that actual increases may be lower on roads that were already busy and therefore would not be able to accommodate significant additional volume. Data from January 2023 indicates that traffic increases have been significantly lower and produced better-than-forecasted traffic volumes on these roads.
- 2.9 We know that Belmont Road, in the Bruce Grove West Green scheme, has been particularly challenging, especially in the first few weeks. Traffic volumes prior to the scheme’s implementation were already high at around 8,500 cars per day and this is now showing an increase of an additional 1,800 vehicles. The report recommends a weight limit for HGVs on Belmont Road/Downhills way - which we expect will take 600 HGVs off this corridor and the Council will continue to actively work with Transport for London to identify and implement mitigations to address any continued disruptions.
- 2.10 The early data on air pollution is encouraging. Air pollution has been going up across London and Haringey – but in our LTNs pollution levels have been held several percentage points lower.
- 2.11 The most dramatic difference is in Bruce Grove, where air pollution was 12.1 points lower than the borough average rise. In Bounds Green and St Ann’s pollution was 3-4 points lower than the average rise as well. That’s a good start but we need to do more.
- 2.12 We want clean air for everyone. Our less well off residents tend to endure worse air pollution – and that has to change.
- 2.13 We have to make our streets safe too. The early results are encouraging here. Speeding is down on most roads in Bruce Grove, down on most internal roads in St Ann’s and some internal roads in Bounds Green. Detailed data on road injuries will be available in time for the next report.

- 2.14 I hope that the positive trends will continue although it is essential to acknowledge that the data collection for several metrics is still in progress. The Council will continue to monitor and evaluate the schemes, taking into account both quantitative data and qualitative feedback from residents, businesses, and other stakeholders. Regular data collection and analysis will allow for a comprehensive assessment of all the scheme's long-term impacts on traffic patterns, air quality, road safety, and other relevant factors.
- 2.15 Community feedback regarding the schemes has shown varying opinions and experiences. Many residents and local businesses have expressed concerns about the potential negative impacts on accessibility and trade, particularly on boundary roads experiencing increased traffic. These concerns highlight the need for ongoing community engagement and dialogue to address any issues that arise and ensure that the LTN strikes a balance between different stakeholder interests.
- 2.16 We want LTNs that are green and fair – and that's why after listening to what residents, communities and businesses have told us over the first few months we're proposing to make some changes. We are proposing to open three roads (one in one direction only), where we think it won't worsen traffic significantly to do so. We're also proposing, via a separate report coming to Cabinet at the same time to introduce a universal LTN exemption for blue badge holders living in Haringey, to make sure our LTNs are fair for those who need to travel by car.
- 2.17 This report represents an interim assessment based on limited quantitative data availability; however, the early indications reveal positive results in terms of reduction in overall traffic volumes and improved environment for incentivising sustainable travel choices. It is my hope that if this positive trend continues and the community feedback later in the year will reflect a more positive experience.

3 Recommendations

Cabinet is asked to:

- 3.1 Note the results of the interim LTN reviews summarised in Sections seven (Bruce Grove West Green LTN), eight (St Ann's LTN), nine (Bounds Green LTN) and detailed in Appendix A1, A2 and A3 (Monitoring Data), Appendix B1, B2 and B3 (Feedback) and Appendix C (Business Perception Surveys) and Appendix D (Footfall and Mastercard Spend Data).
- 3.2 Agree the following physical changes to the Bruce Grove West Green LTN:
 - 1. Remove traffic filter at Linley Road, permitting motor vehicle access in both directions.
 - 2. Permit motor vehicle access on The Avenue in westbound direction, eastbound to remain restricted.
 - 3. Remove traffic filter in Moorefield Road (revert road to one-way), permitting motor vehicle access.
 - 4. Introduce a 7.5 tonne weight limit on Downhills Way and Belmont Road with camera enforcement.
- 3.3 Agree the following physical change to the St Ann's LTN:
 - Move the traffic filter at Avenue Road approximately 10 metres north, removing 4 parking bays to form a turning space.
- 3.4 Authorise the Head of Highways and Parking to revoke and make all necessary new ETOs to give effect to recommendation 3.2 and 3.3 which will trigger a further statutory objection period of 6 months.
- 3.5 Authorise the implementation of changes to the Bruce Grove West Green LTN, subject to the statutory requirements associated with 3.2 and 3.3 and 3.4 following the preparation of detailed designs.
- 3.6 Note the new ETOs will be made to remain in effect for the maximum duration of eighteen months but aiming to decide on the future of the LTNs well in advance of reaching this.
- 3.7 Note that any representations made during the statutory objection period associated with the experimental traffic orders referred to in recommendation 3.2 and 3.3 will be presented to Cabinet in 2024, alongside a final monitoring report, when deciding whether or not to make the traffic orders permanent.
- 3.8 Note that, after consideration of the available options, no interim physical changes are recommended to the Bounds Green LTN.

4 Reasons for decision

- 4.1 The interim review considers the analysis of the data collected and feedback received on each LTN. This includes the legal obligation to consider all formal objections raised on an ETO before determining whether to make the provisions of the TMO permanent. This has led to a number of physical changes being proposed for Bruce Grove West Green LTN and one change for St Ann's LTN.
- 4.2 Although no physical changes have been recommended for Bounds Green LTN, it is important to report on the details of the analysis undertaken on the data and feedback which informed the changes considered, but not recommended.
- 4.3 In accordance with the decision by Cabinet in December 2021, any key decision regarding changes to the LTN would be reported back to the Leader, Cabinet or an individual Cabinet member.
- 4.4 In view of paragraph 3 and to ensure transparency on the impact of the LTN trials to-date, this report is brought to Cabinet for approval.
- 4.5 The reason for recommendation three point 2 and three point three is discussed in paragraphs 7.76 to 7.78, and 8.73 to 8.75 and Appendix G. It is important to note the LTNs have not yet been assessed (and could not have been assessed) with the changes now being proposed and that the ETOs as now proposed would be a genuine and novel experiment.
- 4.6 The reason for recommendation 3.4 to three point six is to enable the Council to implement the changes recommended in paragraphs 3.2 and three point three in accordance with provisions contained within the Road Traffic Regulation Act, 1984 (as amended).

5 Alternative options considered

Do nothing

- 5.1 The aim of the ETOs, which have been in operation for over eight months and can run for a maximum duration of 18 months, is to genuinely undertake an experiment to see if the scheme is working in practice and having the desired outcomes. The December 2021 Cabinet report stated the outcomes desired and made it clear that, if the trial LTNs were implemented, there would be a period of review of the feedback and the monitoring data before taking a decision on whether to make alterations, revoke the ETO or make the trial changes permanent.
- 5.2 A decision on whether to make the trial schemes permanent or revoke the ETOs can be taken before the current traffic orders expire in 2024. However, given the scale of changes delivered, it is appropriate to review the information held to date, both in terms of feedback including formal objections received in the first six months of the statutory objection period and the various data monitored and obtained to date. This is so that the Council can understand if the objectives of the scheme set out in the December 2021 Cabinet report are starting to be realised, whether there

are any negative impacts, and consider if any solutions can be implemented now to mitigate these whilst still aiming to meet the objectives of the scheme.

- 5.3 This review has been undertaken and summarised in this report with more detailed information contained in the appendices.
- 5.4 Given that the review has led to the recommendations to make changes to two of the three trial schemes now, the option of doing nothing now for these two schemes has been rejected.
- 5.5 For the Bounds Green LTN, although no physical changes are recommended in this report, it is appropriate for reasons of transparency that the information used to inform this decision is contained in this report.

Alternative changes to the LTN designs

- 5.6 A broad range of options have been considered, as detailed in the Options Appraisal (Appendix G). Some of these options are recommended for implementation and others are not, for reasons provided within the body of this report.
- 5.7 With over 80 km of roads within and on the boundary of the three LTNs, there are several changes that could be made to the road network. However, the options considered within the Options Appraisal have been led by the results of the Monitoring Reports (data and feedback) and demonstrate that the Council is listening to all feedback.

6 Background information

LTN decision history

- 6.1 In December 2021, Cabinet approved three (Phase 1) LTNs and a range of complementary measures including new pedestrian crossings, cycle hangars and six trial School Streets.
- 6.2 The decision took account of three stages of engagement, carried out over the Spring and Summer 2021, as well as the strategic context that transport plays in terms of the climate emergency, air quality, roads safety and public health.
- 6.3 The LTNs were launched on a trial basis (under ETOs) as follows:
 - Bounds Green LTN on 15 August 2022
 - St Ann's LTN on 22 August 2022
 - Bruce Grove West Green LTN on 1 November 2022

Methodology of the interim LTN review

- 6.4 The 2021 Cabinet report explained that a Monitoring Strategy would be implemented before and during the trial; this is detailed in the:
 - [Bounds Green LTN Monitoring Strategy](#)

- [Bruce Grove West Green LTN Monitoring Strategy](#)
- [St Ann's LTN Monitoring Strategy](#)

6.5 As noted in paragraph 1.1, this report is an interim review of the LTNs and is not the final LTN review which will be conducted at a later date. Therefore, not all monitoring data is available at this point. The following table, taken from the Monitoring Strategies, sets out the type of information the Council is monitoring and identifies whether it is available as part of this interim review and, if so, whether there are any limitations on the data availability:

Type	Monitoring category	Availability for interim review and any limitations
Data	Motor traffic within the LTN	Yes, limited data available for post implementation
	Motor traffic on boundary roads	Yes, limited data available for post implementation
	Motor traffic in neighbouring areas	Yes, limited data available for post implementation
	Levels of walking and cycling within and through the LTN	Yes, cycling only
	Bus journey times	Yes
	Air quality	Yes – limited
	Collisions	No – limited post data available
	Traffic speed	Yes
	Journey times on boundary roads	Yes - for buses only
	Crime and anti-social behaviour	Yes
Feedback	Petitions	Yes
	General feedback via Commonplace (online digital platform) survey	Yes
	Business perception survey	Yes
	Disabled and Carer survey	No – liaison with key disability groups
	Transport for London Buses	Yes
	Emergency services	Yes

6.6 The outputs from the interim review are detailed in the Monitoring Data (Appendix A1,A2,and A3), Feedback (Appendix B1,B2 and B3),Business Perception Survey (Appendix C) and Footfall and Mastercard Spend Data (Appendix D) summarised in the respective section of this report, as follows:

- Section 7 – Interim review of Bruce Grove West Green LTN

- Section 8 - Interim review of St Ann's LTN
- Section 9 - Interim review of Bounds Green LTN

7 Interim review of the Bruce Grove West Green LTN

Key dates

- 7.1 The LTN trial came into effect on 1 November 2022 and, in accordance with national statutory provisions, can in principle operate for a maximum period of 18-months, i.e., until 1 May 2024.
- 7.2 The launch of the trial also triggered the start of a six-month statutory objection period until 1 May 2023.

Changes made following launch of the trial

- 7.3 There have been no changes made to the ETO for this LTN following implementation prior to this report.

Traffic volumes and speed

- 7.4 Appendix A1 provides the full detail and analysis of the data captured before (November 2021) and after (January 2023) the trial LTN scheme was implemented. The flows recorded have been adjusted to normalise for Covid-19 disruption between the months in which the counts have been undertaken. Further detail on this is provided in Appendix A1.
- 7.5 **All motorised traffic volumes:** The data for all motorised traffic is provided as a 7-day daily average. In summary, the data shows that total motorised traffic volumes have decreased for most internal roads. For boundary roads, there has been a slight increase in traffic flows post-implementation.
- 7.6 For internal roads, Langham Road shows the largest reduction in normalised traffic flows, decreasing by approximately 6,700 daily vehicles (roughly the same in both directions), a difference of -91% when compared to pre-implementation normalised flows at the same site. This drop can be explained as this road no longer permits through-traffic. The reduction in Langham Road is to some extent balanced by vehicle numbers remaining in Belmont Road (a boundary road). Some vehicles still accessing this sub-cell are now continuing via Belmont Road, which has seen an increase of over 1,400 daily vehicles (+28%) in the southbound direction. Downhills Park Road near Downhills Park also shows a substantial decrease in daily motor vehicles, of around 6,300 (again split almost equally), equivalent to -84%. The data suggests that the restriction at Downhills Park Road has not led to all the traffic that previously used this road to remain on Belmont Road.
- 7.7 A large proportion of the other internal roads also experienced decreases of at least 70%, with 16 such roads seeing drops of over 1,000 daily vehicles.
- 7.8 However, motor traffic increased on some internal roads, most notably Mount Pleasant Road (by Lordship Lane) which saw an increase in daily vehicles of approximately 1,300 (75%). The likely reason for this is that it is the only remaining access to this sub-cell of the LTN which includes Broadwater Farm Estate.

- 7.9 For boundary roads, in addition to the increase on Belmont Road described in seven point six above, the A504 West Green Road (measured at the junction with Etherley Road) has seen a significant increase in daily traffic volumes, amounting to 5,000 more vehicles (+41%) and West Green Road (@Carlingford Road) has seen an increase of just over 3,900 daily vehicles (+27%). West Green Road is a notable location as its western end is the joint boundary with St Ann's LTN and therefore the increase in traffic here is a cumulation of the displacement effects from two LTNs.
- 7.10 Several other boundary roads also saw traffic flow increases post-implementation, for example Green Lanes (@Carlingford Road) with an increase of around 4,700 daily vehicles (+22%). Trends on boundary roads generally indicate that there is a joint increase in traffic on West Green Road, with the Bruce Grove West Green scheme to the north and St. Ann's scheme to the south – as well as at the northern section of Green Lanes (@ Carlingford Road) directly to the west of the scheme area. Westbury Avenue also sees increases in traffic. However, increases on Lordship Lane and Bruce Grove show a more mixed picture, and Philip Lane shows a moderate decrease in overall traffic.
- 7.11 Further mitigations for West Green Road outside the proposals within this report are being considered in conjunction with TfL. These include removing parking at critical locations along the West Green Road corridor where the road is particularly narrow or where bus drivers have stated they are experiencing delays. Changes to the traffic signals at the West Green Road /Belmont Road junction to facilitate better operation of the signal junction are also being explored. These changes, aimed at addressing journey time delay experienced by buses using this corridor, will be subject to a separate report being submitted to the Cabinet Member for Tackling Inequality and Resident Services in July. Monitoring of traffic levels will continue, especially on boundary roads which have shown an increase in motor traffic volumes post-implementation.
- 7.12 **Goods vehicle traffic volumes:** As goods vehicle traffic is generally lighter during weekends, this has been considered in detail as a 5-day average. This includes consideration of light goods vehicles (LGV, typically vans) and heavy goods vehicles (HGV, larger than a van).
- 7.13 On internal roads, whilst the volumes of both LGVs and HGVs decreased by the same percentage (-37%), the proportion of these vehicles compared to total motorised vehicles increased slightly. This indicates that routing choices for these vehicles are less flexible than for general traffic, likely because a higher percentage of LGVs and HGVs need to drop off or pick up at specific households/businesses within the LTN area than is seen for general traffic.
- 7.14 For HGVs, a number of internal roads saw decreases of over 100 daily vehicles. In contrast, the biggest change was seen on Wimborne Road, where HGV volumes increased from 12 to over 200 daily vehicles. Further monitoring is required because, although demolition works took place at Broad Water Farm Estate during the period, when data was captured, the numbers of HGVs being used was low and therefore could not have lead to the increased HGV activity in this location.

- 7.15 Boundary roads saw different trends for LGVs and HGVs. The total volume of LGVs decreased slightly, even whilst the total number of motorised vehicles increased, meaning that such vehicles also ended up comprising a smaller proportion of total vehicles. Most boundary roads saw an increase in daily HGVs, with West Green Road (@Carlingford Road), Downhills Way and Westbury Avenue (@Willingdon Road) all seeing increases of over 200 daily HGVs – for Downhills Way, this represented more than a doubling in the flows of such vehicles. In contrast, sites elsewhere on Westbury Avenue (@Mannock Road) and on West Green Road (@Etherley Road) saw decreases of over 100 daily HGVs.
- 7.16 **Motorcycle volumes:** As with goods vehicles, motorcycle volumes decreased across most internal roads, but not to the same extent as general traffic – so with a 36% drop in motorcycles (-1,844 per day) came an increase in proportional representation from 6% to 8%, perhaps indicating less flexibility for motorcycles (and motorcycle-based deliveries) than for general traffic in terms of routing options.
- 7.17 For boundary roads, it appears that motorcycles have increased at a slightly higher rate than has total motorised traffic, with an increase of 15% or around 1,100 daily vehicles – shifting the proportion of motorcycles on boundary roads from 4% to 5%.
- 7.18 **Cycle volumes:** Unlike motorised traffic trends, cycling levels are significantly impacted by seasonal weather change including temperature and rainfall; for example, there is normally much more cycling participation in July than in January.
- 7.19 Cycling levels have slightly increased across both internal roads and boundary roads between the two monitoring periods, with both sets of roads seeing summed increases of just over 10% (+12% for internal roads and +11% for boundary roads).
- 7.20 On internal roads, no change of more than 100 daily cycles counted was noted, with the largest change being +70 (+52%) on Sandringham Road – notable as it indicates that cyclists are not deterred from using this street even though motorised traffic has nearly doubled here. Pembury Road (close to the High Road junction) and Stanmore Road also saw increases of >50 daily cycles counted. Greyhound Road saw the largest decrease in cycles counted (-69), followed by Adams Road (-52).
- 7.21 Cycle count changes on boundary roads were dominated by figures from Philip Lane, which increased nearly seven-fold from 75 to 560 (+485 daily cycles), which were only partially offset by a drop of 117 daily cycles on West Green Road (@Etherley Road). This could be explained by the fact that Philip Lane has cycling infrastructure making it a more attractive route to use, especially given that it connects to Cycleway 1 (Cycle Superhighway 1) and motor traffic levels on this road have decreased slightly.
- 7.22 **Vehicle speeds:** Speeding is a major contributing factor to road danger, so reducing speeding is vital to making roads safer for all. In general, vehicle speeds across internal and boundary roads have decreased across key metrics between the November 2021 pre-implementation and January 2023 post-implementation survey periods, although in all cases by <10% when weighted averages are calculated.

- 7.23 The internal road location with the largest increase in average speeds was Downhills Park Road (near the Philip Road junction), where speeds were up by 3.6mph on average, making it the only internal road with a double-digit percentage point increase in speeding vehicles. Lordship Lane (@Elsdon Road) also saw an increase of 2.2mph. Monitoring is ongoing with particular focus on roads where speeds have increased.
- 7.24 On boundary roads, average speeds decreased by 0.9mph with Westbury Avenue (@Willingdon Road) seeing the largest decrease in vehicle speeds, of -2.8mph, and West Green Road (@Carlingford Road) and Philip Lane both saw decreases of -2.0mph. It is noted that on some of these roads, congestion may play a role in reduced average speeds. In contrast, average speeds increased by 2.2mph on Lordship Lane (@Elsden Road), whilst 85th percentile speeds on Belmont Road increased by 1.9mph, indicating a large spread in vehicle speeds in this location. Monitoring is ongoing with particular focus on roads where speeds have increased.

Bus journey times

- 7.25 Liaison with TfL commenced before the trial scheme went in, with monitoring undertaken of journey time for buses along four main boundary road corridors.
- 7.26 Weekly iBus data provided by TfL has been used for analysis on these routes. This gives weekday (Monday to Friday, excluding bank holidays) average journey times by route, stop-to-stop link and peak periods. These journey times exclude dwell times at stops.
- 7.27 The data included in Appendix A1 shows graphs for these key corridors. These indicate weekly journey times (12 hour between 7am-7pm) with baselines (upper, lower and average) provided on what the journey times would be expected under “normal” conditions. Journey times are based on speed of travel of buses, hence showing as time taken to travel a kilometre.
- 7.28 **High Road, N17:** Bus speeds and times along the High Road corridor in both directions have fluctuated significantly throughout the assessed period. Allowing a bedding in period for the scheme, the latest information available indicates that bus journey times have improved since the spike when the scheme was implemented. For northbound buses before Bruce Grove West Green LTN implementation, there have been spikes in journey times both above (October 2020, August 2021) and below (April 2020) TfL’s normal range for bus speed, with values ranging from 3.5min/km to nearly 6min/km. After LTN implementation the journey time fluctuation remained in a similar range. Southbound traffic has seen similar fluctuations, although since the Bruce Grove scheme was implemented, there has been a clearer increase in bus journey times, particularly just after the scheme was implemented (November 2022) as well as in February 2023, which saw vehicle speeds nearing 6.5min/km during several weeks.
- 7.29 **Lordship Lane & Bruce Grove:** The data for the Lordship Lane & Bruce Grove corridor shows a considerable difference for eastbound and westbound vehicles.

For westbound vehicles, except for a number of isolated spikes in journey times (that appear throughout the dataset with no clear correlation to outside events), journey speeds are very stable around the pre-COVID average of 3min/km. In contrast, journey speeds in the eastbound direction have fluctuated significantly along this corridor from around March 2022, before the Bruce Grove West Green scheme was introduced – and have since had two periods of considerably slower journey times (early summer 2022 and winter 2022/23). Whilst it is possible that the scheme has contributed to some of this change, it is likely that some other confounding factors are affecting bus journey times along this section of road and warrants further monitoring and investigation .

- 7.30 **Lordship Lane East:** Bus journey speeds on the eastern section of Lordship Lane, between the Bruce Grove and High Road, N17 junctions, have fluctuated above and below the baseline standard deviations for both directions of travel. Before the Bruce Grove West Green scheme was introduced, bus speeds in the eastbound direction peaked several times at about 5min/km, although were around 3min/km during the COVID-19 peak of spring 2020, but increased to 7min/km shortly after the scheme went live (although these figures have since dropped again to below the pre-COVID average). Westbound speeds fluctuated as well, although the slowest speeds have consistently reached around 7.5min/km both before and after scheme introduction, with periods of slow travel being short-lived and typically resolving within a few weeks.
- 7.31 **West Green Road & Philip Lane Corridor:** Bus journey speeds in the eastbound direction have generally stayed within the pre-COVID range at or faster than 4min/km, although there have been several periods where speeds slowed to 5min/km both before and after scheme introduction.
- 7.32 In the westbound direction, there has been a clearer increase in bus journey times, with latest journeys taking about 4.9min/km when compared to the average threshold of about 4min/km, again slower than normal.
- 7.33 Mitigations for West Green Road described in brief under seven point eleven, will help address some of the delays buses are experiencing along this corridor. Changes to traffic restrictions recommended in this report, if approved, will likely impact on the bus routes described above. Should these changes be approved, monitoring these routes will be key to see if any positive change has been delivered to bus journey times. TfL is supportive of measures to reduce motor vehicle travel and prioritising active travel and use of buses. As this scheme has been delivered over a large area, it is expected that a longer period will be required to allow traffic patterns to settle. Improving bus journey times remains a priority for both TfL and Haringey, especially as many of our residents rely on this as their main means of transport. Joint monitoring will continue, and this includes direct engagement with bus drivers. Further mitigations will be explored depending on the results of monitoring.
- 7.34 **Westbury Avenue Corridor:** Bus journey times along Westbury Avenue corridor have spiked over several periods on the northbound direction to above 9min/km

before the implementation of the trial scheme but have since consistently remained at under 5min/km and appear to be continuing this trend into 2023. Whilst the picture is more mixed along the southbound corridor, the spikes have not exceeded 7min/km but do appear to have increased slightly after implementation of the LTN.

Air quality

- 7.35 Air quality varies naturally over time due to a variety of factors, including seasonal variations, weather and other non-transport factors. It is therefore important to look at trends over a longer period of time, ideally for a year, to identify real changes in air quality that could be attributed to the scheme. The ultimate goal of our air quality strategy is to reduce air pollution as much as possible, and certainly to within legal limits.
- 7.36 The location of air quality monitoring sites is listed in Appendix E.
- 7.37 Whilst the review point for this experimental scheme is at six months, there is a time delay in obtaining air quality data and as such only two months of data is available post-implementation, to January 2023. This means that making comparisons between short periods of time before and after scheme implementation is unlikely to yield meaningful results, and that presenting air quality data on a site-by-site basis would be incomplete and not statistically significant enough to draw any conclusions.
- 7.38 In order to present a meaningful picture of the impact of the scheme on local air quality the overall trend of NO₂ levels (as an average across all site types) has been considered to show how air quality has changed over time.
- 7.39 Appendix A1 provides details of the results of the air quality monitoring. Graph 1 Average NO₂ Levels in Bruce Grove West Green LTN Compared to Long-Term Borough-Wide Sites from Diffusion Tubes shows:
- 7.40 The full-year air quality data between 2018 and 2022. Therefore, this spans the period of the COVID-19 pandemic when the background patterns were not typical of other years. There are considerable seasonal impacts on NO₂ levels, typically the measured levels of NO₂ are lower in warmer months and higher levels in colder months.
- 7.41 The impact of COVID-19 on air quality is visible during the 2020 and 2021 lockdowns when NO₂ levels were much lower.
- 7.42 The LTN-specific monitors listed in Appendix D were installed in June 2021 and these results (shown as separate lines on the graph from that time) show results as many people returned to work. Daily travel routines in 2022 began to increase slightly.
- 7.43 Based on the full calendar year data available at background sites, average NO₂ levels fell from an average 44 µg/m³ in the 2019 peak to 30 µg/m³ in 2021, before increasing slightly to 31 µg/m³ for 2022, a total 30% reduction from peak levels.

- 7.44 LTN sites, appreciating that 2021 data was only a very small monitoring sample, only beginning in June of that year, saw the same trend for 2021/2022 as we see across the borough. i.e. a slight increase in average NO₂ concentrations. However, the Bruce Grove LTN sites saw a significantly smaller increase in NO₂ concentrations when compared to the borough wide sites. Roadside sites within the LTN only saw a 0.9% increase NO₂ concentrations compared to a 13% increase in the wider borough. Urban Background sites within the LTN saw a 1% decrease in NO₂ concentrations compared to the wider borough, which saw a 9% increase in the same time period.
- 7.45 Appreciating that the above is based on a very limited dataset with only three months of comparable data, the initial analysis would indicate that the Bruce Grove West Green LTN is delivering the intended impact of improving the local Air Quality, and that without the implementation of the LTN it is highly likely that the concentrations of NO₂ would be comparable to that of the background sites.
- 7.46 At the end of 2023 when a full year's results are available post LTN implementation, accurate annualised and bias adjusted data will provide a more accurate indication of air quality performance for the Bruce Grove West Green LTN.

Collisions

- 7.47 Road casualty data is available from Transport for London (TfL) who collate collision data recorded in London by the Metropolitan Police Service (MPS). The latest data available is up to December 2022. Given the very limited data available post-implementation of the trial scheme, no meaningful analysis can be undertaken to draw any conclusions on whether the changes implemented have had a positive or negative impact on road traffic collisions. This data will continue to be monitored and reported when the final decision is taken on the scheme in 2024, by which time a year's data should be available.

Emergency services

- 7.48 Officers liaised with emergency services throughout the engagement phase of the scheme which helped inform the Cabinet decision in December 2021. This included altering some restrictions from physically closed to camera enforced, allowing these services access through the majority of restrictions. Liaison has been ongoing with regular feedback sought from all three emergency services - ambulance, fire and police. Although emergency services are exempt from the 'No Motor Vehicle' restrictions which are camera enforced, ongoing discussions have been helpful to draw out any issues experienced with accessing properties or on response times. Latest feedback received was positive of the way Haringey Council has engaged with emergency services and responding to concerns including granting exemptions to key personnel whose role requires them to attend site post-incident. No issues have been highlighted with the trial scheme and its impact on their services.

Crime and anti-social behaviour

- 7.49 Whilst there are only six months of crime data following from the introduction of the scheme, there is so far no conclusive evidence based on the data that crime patterns within the Bruce Grove West Green LTN area have changed following the scheme's introduction. Therefore, the data shown in Table 14 (Table 14: Proportional Breakdown of Calls and Crimes in Bruce Grove West Green LTN and Haringey) in Appendix A1 can only be used as an indication of an underlying trend compared with previous years before the LTN was introduced.
- 7.50 The number of criminal activity reports in the scheme area and in the borough-at-large are broadly similar, both before and after the scheme's introduction. The Council will continue to monitor recorded crime to see if any changes are reflected over time as the scheme further beds-in.
- 7.51 Similar to other boroughs, there have been a number of instances where traffic restriction cameras and signs have been tampered with. This is a criminal offence and, where evidence of this has been captured, this has been passed to the Met Police for investigation. Work is ongoing to protect these assets.

Footfall and high street MasterCard Spend

- 7.52 Appendix D provides graphs showing weekly footfall along Bruce Grove A10 for the whole of 2022 and for up to March 2023. This shows footfall is impacted by changing seasons and more recently likely also by COVID-19 and the cost-of-living crisis. The busiest week for footfall in 2022 was week 30 where 219,744 visitors were registered. The lowest week for footfall in 2022 when all four counters were operational was week 52 with 127,246 visitors. The lowest footfall week mirrored other high streets and town centres in the borough.
- 7.53 Footfall in week 21 of 2023 was 8.72% higher than week 44 of 2022 – the first week of the Bruce Grove/West Green LTN. Footfall was higher in 17 of the 30 weeks since the footfall recorded in week 44 (160,689) – the first week of the Bruce Grove/West Green LTN. This matches the trends in other high streets and town centres across the borough. The fluctuations in footfall here are also influenced by event days at Tottenham Hotspur Stadium.
- 7.54 A second graph is also provided in the appendix. This shows Mastercard indexed spend data per week for Bruce Grove from week 1 of 2022 – week 19 of 2023. Instore indexed card spend was lower in all the weeks from week 44 of 2022 – the first week of the Bruce Grove West Green LTN implementation to week 6 of 2023. Week 7 of 2023 is the only week since week 44 of 2022 that indexed card spend has been higher, with spend returning to lower than week 44 of 2022 levels from week 8 of 2023
- 7.55 A comparison of Bruce Grove Indexed Instore Card Spend year-on-Year Comparison 2019 – 2022, shows lower levels to Crouch End, Green Lanes and Muswell Hill and shows a variation in trends of spend from comparable district centres. Whilst the local centres are of similar size, it is difficult to compare like for

like across local centres and high streets due to varying demographics. The fluctuations of spend show the individuality of each local centre.

- 7.56 The graph for Mastercard spend data from Bruce Grove A10 shows seasonal fluctuations and again may be impacted also by COVID-19 and the cost-of-living crisis. Nevertheless, the Bruce Grove A10 Mastercard spend data suggests a similar pattern to other high streets not in an LTN.
- 7.57 The Council has also launched a boroughwide Haringey Business Survey and the outcome of this will help inform the type of support required.

Feedback – Commonplace survey and map

- 7.58 The Commonplace exercise for the Bruce Grove West Green LTN was carried out between Monday 30th January and Friday 10th March 2023. The results are detailed in Appendix B1 (Feedback). This was an online digital platform allowing feedback to be provided on the scheme through answering a series of questions and was open to anyone, meaning not just those who live, work or travel through the area. The second part of the survey allowed respondents to point at a location on an interactive map and provide feedback on how they felt about that location, any concerns they had and any solutions they wanted the council to explore.
- 7.59 3072 responses were provided, with a majority reporting negative sentiment (68.6%) towards the LTN.
- 7.60 These findings differed significantly by car access, with respondents with access to a car being more likely than those without to report a negative sentiment (72.8% vs 34.9%). The findings suggest an increase in negative sentiment since the introduction of the LTN.
- 7.61 The majority of respondents (916) described themselves as living within Area A followed by 391 within Area B and then 150 living on a boundary road. The main recurring comments from all roads in the Bruce Grove West Green LTN were as follows:
- Traffic congestion, traffic build-up and displacement
 - Road safety has improved
 - Road safety concerns
 - Environment improved for active travel
 - Antisocial behaviour concerns
 - Feedback – emails and portal correspondence
- 7.62 A total of 33 respondents provided 136 comments regarding their views on the LTN. The most common themes identified from these responses related to 'Congestion/traffic build-up/displacement', 'Modify the LTN', and 'Air quality concerns'.

- 7.63 Comments relating to 'Congestion/traffic build-up/displacement' referred to the increased congestion on boundary roads caused by the LTN. Some comments mentioned increased journey times and increased pollution as a result of the congestion. Congestion/traffic build-up/displacement was commonly cited on the following roads: West Green Road; Belmont Road; Philip Lane; Moselle Avenue; and Willingdon Road.
- 7.64 Comments relating to 'Modify the LTN' suggested that adjustments should be made to alleviate the congestion and increased traffic build-up on boundary roads. Suggested adjustments included: re-opening some of the through roads between St Ann's Road and West Green Road; creating a right turning lane on West Green Road at the junction with Belmont Road; introducing time restrictions so that the LTN is only active during peak hours; and expanding the LTN to include Belmont Road.
- 7.65 Most comments relating to 'Air quality concerns' referred to the increased pollution on boundary roads due to the congestion caused by the LTN. Some of these comments cited difficulties in active travel due to the poor air quality on roads such as West Green Road, while other comments made by residents, including residents on Belmont Road and Langham Road, cited concerns about the potential negative health impacts that poor air quality may have on residents.
- 7.66 When asked what action you want the Council to consider, 1,014 respondents provided a total of 1,058 comments regarding actions they would like the Council to consider. The most common themes identified from these responses related to 'Remove the LTN' (328 responses), 'Support the LTN' (301 responses), and 'Modify the LTN' (123 responses).

Business Perception Survey

- 7.67 A bespoke survey was undertaken to seek feedback from businesses located inside and on the immediate boundary of the LTNs. The Council commissioned ECF, an engagement consultancy, to undertake this work. This involved the survey company visiting business premises and either completing the survey with them or leaving them with a paper copy of the survey to fill and send back to the Council. The feedback from the respondents in all 3 LTN areas was consistent in the themes expressed.
- Most of the businesses employ less than 5 people in line with the SME business size.
 - Most travel by car/motorbike (38%) followed by public transport (29%), then by walking (24%).
 - The number of employees remained the same after the implementation of the LTN.

- Numbers of customers has reduced and respondents attribute this to the introduction of the LTN traffic congestion rather than the cost of living or wider economic downturn.
- Customer's travel mode has experienced a majority shift from motor vehicle to walking since the introduction of Bruce Grove West Green LTN.

7.68 A total of 532 businesses in the Bruce Grove West Green LTN were visited during May 2023. From these, there were 60 respondents. This represents an 11% response rate. The themes emerging from the results of the survey is similar across all 3 LTNs and the vast majority of businesses employ a maximum of 4 people. Responses were received from the following shopping streets.

7.69 **Moorfield Road** From those traders who responded to the business perception survey, 75% reported a decrease in customers as well as loss of turnover. This was 75% attributed to the introduction of the LTN and 25% due to the cost of living. Concerning how their customers travel to the businesses, the Business Perception Survey result indicates there is a 50% transfer of mode from motor vehicle to walking.

7.70 **The Avenue/ Mount Pleasant Road** There was an insufficient response rate from this shopping area to use to draw meaningful conclusions.

7.71 **West Green Road** From those traders who responded to the Business Perception Survey 86% reported a decrease in customers and 76% reported a loss of turnover in the last 4 months. This was 78% attributed to the introduction of the LTN and the other 22% due to the cost of living and lack of parking facilities. Concern was raised about how their customer travel to the businesses. The business perception survey result indicates there is a 33% transfer of mode from motor vehicle to walking.

Formal objections

7.72 During the six-month statutory consultation period, 783 formal objections were lodged with the Council. The top five themes mentioned in the objections raised are noted below. These have been considered and would have informed the final decision; however, changes are being proposed to this scheme which, if approved, will result in a new ETO coming into effect. This ETO will trigger a six-month statutory objection period, and the response to this will be considered in detail and reported on as part of the final review of the LTN.

7.73 Top five themes highlighted in the objections received are:

- Congestion/traffic build-up/displacement
- Air quality concerns
- Increased journey times
- Disproportionate effects/discrimination associated with LTNs

- Negative impact on business/the economy

Petitions / deputations

7.74 In February 2023, Full Council¹ received three petitions, two of which are pertinent to this LTN:

- Petition 1. 4238 signatures objecting to the “St Ann’s and West Green LTN”
- Petition 3. 7528 signatures objecting to “West Green and Bruce Grove LTN”

7.75 At the same meeting, a deputation was heard that specifically related to the boundary between St Ann’s and West Green Road and the detrimental effect it was having on the Orthodox Jewish Community. The deputation called upon the LTN to be removed or amend the scheme to relieve the hardship it was causing on local families.

Option appraisal

7.76 The aim of the ETO is to see if the scheme is working and, if not, then identify if any mitigation can be made. In addition to capturing data and feedback via surveys, the Council has considered the feedback received via email and other means including direct meetings with ward councillors, residents, businesses and groups as well as formal objections lodged on the current scheme. Taking all of that into account, an Options Appraisal has been carried out, as contained in Appendix G. This details a range of changes considered to provide more access to residents and businesses inside the LTN as well as measures to address any negative impacts on some boundary roads. The risks and benefits of each option are contained within the appraisal.

7.77 The following options have been considered:

1. Open Linley Road to motor vehicles (remove traffic filter and allow access two way)
2. Open Moorefield Road to motor vehicles (remove filter and revert road to one way)
3. Open The Avenue to motor vehicles (allow access two way)
4. Open Downhills Park Road in eastbound direction to motor vehicles (allow motor vehicle access eastbound through traffic filter)
5. Belmont Road / Downhills Way- introduce a 7.5T weight restriction
6. Open Gloucester Road and or Higham Road/Dongola Road to motor vehicles (remove filter and allow access from the north of Area A, which includes Broadwater Farm Estate, to Philip Lane)

¹ <https://www.minutes.haringey.gov.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CIId=143&MIId=10509>

7. Introduce right turn ban for motor vehicles exiting Belmont Road onto West Green Road

7.78 Having taken account of the risks and benefits of each option and the feedback provided, officers consider that, on balance, and for the reasons summarised below, the following options are recommended to be implemented under ETOs:

1. Linley Road. The additional access and egress would benefit residents particularly in the north part of the LTN (including Broadwater Farm estate) and alleviate access demands on Mount Pleasant Road where it joins Lordship Lane.
2. Moorefield Road. Removes need to U-turn, especially for large vehicles improving safety.
3. The Avenue. Amended to westbound only access. This assists safe cycling while permitting access from Bruce Grove A10 to properties to the north of the LTN, including Broadwater Farm estate.
4. Belmont Road and Downhills Way. Introduce a 7.5T weight restriction to address the measured increase in HGVs.

8 Interim review of the St Ann's LTN

Key dates

- 8.1 The LTN trial came into effect on 22 August 2022 and, in accordance with national statutory provisions, can in principle operate for a maximum period of 18-months, i.e., until 22 February 2024.
- 8.2 The launch of the trial also triggered the start of a six-month statutory objection period until 22 February 2023.
- 8.3 The ETOs were modified, to enable the changes noted in paragraph eight point four to be implemented. Consequently, the six-month statutory objection period was extended and ended on 21 March 2023.

Changes made following launch of the trial

- 8.4 The following change was applied post-implementation to satisfy the requirements of individual residents as reasonable adjustments for a disabled resident in La Rose Lane:
 - 8.5 Replace zig zag markings with double yellow lines (No Waiting at Any Time) on La Rose Lane (known as Black Boy Lane at the time) N15 outside No.89/87 for 9.8 metres.
 - 8.6 Remove a section of the one-way restriction introduced on Cranleigh Road N15 between its junction with La Rose Lane (Black Boy Lane, at the time) and the eastern property boundary of No.63 Cranleigh Road.

Traffic volumes and speed

- 8.7 Appendix A2 provides the full detail and analysis of the data captured before (November 2021) and after (January 2023) the trial LTN scheme was implemented. The flows recorded have been adjusted to normalise for COVID-19 disruption between the months in which the counts have been undertaken. Further detail on this is provided in Appendix A2.
- 8.8 **All motorised traffic volumes:** The trends for motor vehicles on the St Ann's LTN internal roads indicate that total motorised vehicle volumes have declined for the majority of LTN internal streets. Prior to the trial scheme being implemented, there were four main corridors that allowed North-South movement, some in one direction only. These are La Rose Lane, Woodlands Park Road, Avenue Road and Cornwall Road; as expected following the restrictions being applied, all four have seen a substantial decrease. La Rose Lane (near Chestnuts Park) experienced the largest reductions in normalised traffic flows, decreasing by approximately 7,984 daily vehicles, a difference of -85%. This can be explained by the traffic filter on La Rose Lane, which no longer permits through-traffic between B152 St Anns Road and A504 West Green Road in both directions.

- 8.9 Cornwall Road also saw a substantial decrease in daily motorised vehicles, of around 3,420, which is also equivalent to -85%. Although due to the one-way traffic filter on Cornwall Road, some of these flows may now also be contributing to additional traffic on Dagmar Road and Clarence Road, as vehicles try to navigate and exit the sub-cell (a group of streets within a Low Traffic Neighbourhood).
- 8.10 Woodlands Park Road saw a drop of 3600 and 2400 vehicles measured at two locations, whilst Avenue Road saw a drop of 2500 and 3000 vehicles measured at two locations.
- 8.11 Overall, of the 50 internal sites, 36 saw decreases in traffic volumes, nine of which were decreases of over 1,000 daily vehicles.
- 8.12 In contrast to this, traffic increased on some internal roads after the LTN was implemented. Most notably, Westerfield Road saw an increase in daily vehicles of approximately 1,038 (65%), likely because this is the only road that allows vehicles to move between A504 West Green Road and A503 Seven Sisters Road. Colina Mews experienced the most significant percentage increase of 85%, although this only accounts for around 73 more motor vehicles daily when normalised. The Council will continue to monitor the traffic volumes at these locations.
- 8.13 Trends for motor vehicles on boundary roads indicate that there is an increase in traffic at the western end of West Green Road near Etherley Road, of around 5000 vehicles, with a smaller increase of 3900 near Carlingford Road, further west. However, West Green Road at the eastern end at Suffield Road saw a decrease of 1,600 daily vehicles (-14%). West Green Road is a shared boundary road with the Bruce Grove West Green LTN to the north and St. Ann's LTN to the south.
- 8.14 Seven Sisters Road saw an increase of around 3000 daily vehicles; the largest percentage increase was on Colina Road (linking St Ann's Road to Green Lanes), which saw an 84% increase, equating to around 1,800 daily vehicles.
- 8.15 Conversely, the most significant decrease by volume was seen on St. Ann's Road. At the Cornwall Road/Hermitage Road, daily traffic reduced by 25%, amounting to around 4,100 fewer vehicles. At the Suffolk Road end, a decrease of 3,300 daily vehicles (-23%) was seen.
- 8.16 Ultimately, whilst these findings indicate that the total volume of traffic on internal and boundary roads has decreased since the St Ann's LTN trial, a number of internal and boundary roads have seen significant increases over the same time period.
- 8.17 Monitoring will continue for all roads included in Appendix A2, with a particular focus on roads where volumes have significantly gone up. This information will be included in the final review of the LTNs and be subject to a report going to Cabinet on the future of the LTN.
- 8.18 **Goods vehicles traffic volumes:** As goods vehicle traffic is generally lighter during weekends, this has been considered in detail as a 5-day average. This includes consideration of light goods vehicles (LGV, typically vans) and heavy goods vehicles (HGV, larger than a van).

- 8.19 On internal roads, the volumes of HGVs (-37%) has decreased at a higher percentage than that of LGVs (-29%). This indicates that routing choices for these vehicles are less flexible than for general traffic, likely because a higher percentage of LGVs and HGVs need to drop off or pick up at specific households/businesses within the LTN area than is seen for general traffic.
- 8.20 Overall, around 65% of sites saw a net decrease in LGVs, 10 of which saw decreases of over 50 such vehicles per day. Of these, La Rose Lane saw the largest decreases, with a drop of over 500 daily LGVs although this site saw an increase in HGVs of a smaller degree. Conversely, Suffield Road saw the largest increases, of around 230 LGVs per day, but saw a decrease in HGVs. For HGVs, there were a number of roads with decreases of over 100 daily vehicles, including the aforementioned Suffield Road, Woodlands Park Road (at Clarendon Road), La Rose Lane (at Chestnuts Park) and Avenue Road (at Ida Road). Other than the potential shifting of LGVs to HGVs on La Rose Lane, no internal site gained a notable number of HGVs.
- 8.21 As expected, boundary roads saw an increase in the volume of LGVs and HGVs, in which volumes of LGVs increased by 20% and volumes of HGVs increased by 23%, both ahead of the motorised vehicle changes for boundary roads.
- 8.22 The section of Harringay Road between St. Ann's Road and Green Lanes saw a significant increase in both LGVs and HGVs, with an 11-percentage point increase in the prevalence of LGVs and 12-fold increase in the volume of HGVs, likely as this is the only remaining link between two key boundary roads (in the northbound direction, at least). In addition, the St. Ann's Road site at Suffolk Road saw a substantial increase in the volume of HGVs (nearly 850 additional per day), the cause of which is unclear. Several sites along West Green Road also saw increases in LGV volumes of over 500 per day, although for most of these sites, the increase in LGVs was countered by a decrease in HGVs. Only Alfoxton Avenue saw an overall decrease in total goods vehicles, mostly driven by reductions in LGV volumes. Overall, as expected, the data on goods vehicles indicates that on internal roads the volumes of such vehicles have dropped considerably, whilst on boundary roads, volumes have increased by similar margins. The Council will continue to monitor roads where such trends have been observed.
- 8.23 **Motorcycle volumes:** As with goods vehicles, motorcycle volumes decreased across most internal roads, but not to the same extent as general traffic – so with a 10% drop in motorcycles (around 360 fewer per day) came an increase in proportional representation from 5% to 11%, perhaps indicating less flexibility for motorcycles (and motorcycle-based deliveries) than for general traffic in terms of routing options. A range of roads saw substantial reductions in motorcycle volumes – for example, Cornwall Road (at site 47/West Green Road), La Rose Lane (at Chestnuts Park), La Rose Lane (at site 31) and Woodlands Park Road (at site 87/Avondale Road) all saw reductions of over 100 daily motorcycles.
- 8.24 For boundary roads, it appears that motorcycles have increased at a slightly higher rate than has total motorised traffic, with an increase of 25% or around 1,373 daily

vehicles – shifting the proportion of motorcycles on boundary roads from 4% to 6%. Motorcycle volumes increased across nearly all roads, in which there were five roads which saw an increase in over 100 daily motorcycles, with B152 St Ann's Road (@Chestnuts Park) seeing the largest increase in both volume (+454 daily vehicles) and percentage (+180%). A504 West Green Road (@Bedford Road/Lawrence Road) and B152 St Ann's Road (@Suffolk Road) were the only sites that saw a decrease in volume -9 (-1%) daily vehicles and -42 (-7%) daily vehicles respectively.

- 8.25 Overall, it appears that motorcycle volumes tend to follow the general trend of motorised vehicles (decrease for internal roads and increase for boundary roads) but with a higher degree of prevalence, particularly on internal roads.
- 8.26 Cycle volumes: Unlike motorised traffic trends, cycling levels are significantly impacted by seasonal weather change including temperature and rainfall; for example, there is normally much more cycling participation in July than in January.
- 8.27 Cycling levels have decreased across both internal roads and boundary roads between the two monitoring periods, with both sets of roads seeing summed decreases of around 20% (-17% for internal roads and -22% for boundary roads). Internal roads saw a decrease of around 651 daily cycles counted, and boundary roads saw a decrease of around 938 such cyclists, with the majority of roads contributing to the overall decrease.
- 8.28 On internal roads, there were only three locations that saw change of more than 100 daily cycles counted. Both Avenue Road (site 95/Ida Road) and B152 Harringay Road experienced the largest decreases of -209 and -102 daily cycles, in which both represent a change of -59%. Cornwall Road (site 47/West Green Road) saw the largest increase of cycles counted (+103), representing a 246% increase.
- 8.29 Cycle count changes on boundary roads were dominated by figures on B152 St Ann's Road, which decreased from 768 to 317 (-451 daily cycles) at the Chestnuts Park junction, by -322 daily cycles at the Salisbury Road junction, by -225 daily cycles at the Rowley Road/La Rose Lane junction and by -184 daily cycles at the Hermitage Road/Cornwall Road junction. This was partially offset by an increase of 267 daily cycles at the Suffolk Road junction of B152 St Ann's Road. For other streets, there was only one additional location which saw an increase, which was at the A504 West Green Road (Bedford Road/Lawrence Road junction), which increased by 96 daily cycles.
- 8.30 Cycling patterns have been difficult to interpret based on the data available, likely because levels were relatively low during both data collection periods due to the time of year. It is expected that further data captured in summer months will provide more insight as to how cycle travel in and around the scheme area might be changing.
- 8.31 **Vehicle speeds:** Speeding is a major contributing factor to road danger, so reducing speeding is vital to making roads safer for all.

- 8.32 In general, vehicle speeds across internal roads have decreased or remained the same across key metrics between the November 2021 pre-implementation and January 2023 post-implementation survey periods, whilst vehicle speeds across boundary roads have increased across key metrics in the same survey period.
- 8.33 On internal roads, there are a wide range of changes for vehicle speeds, although it is noted that the low volumes of traffic on many roads in the post-implementation stage means that values during this stage of data collection are quite easily skewed. However, it appears that, in general, average vehicle speeds across these roads remained similar, decreasing by about 0.3mph or 3% of pre-implementation values. In contrast, the internal road location with the largest increase in average speeds was La Rose Lane (at Chestnuts Park junction), where speeds were up by 3.3mph on average, whilst Avenue Road (@Newsam Avenue) also saw an increase of 3.2mph.
- 8.34 On boundary roads, average speeds increased by 0.4mph or 3%, whilst the proportion of vehicles speeding increased by 5 percentage points. This was almost entirely driven by increased vehicle speeds on St. Ann's Road, which have increased by at least 2.9mph at every site except at the Suffolk Road junction. It is expected that this relates to lower traffic on St. Ann's Road, but the Council will continue to closely monitor speeding in these locations. Other sites, particularly on West Green Road, saw decreases in traffic speeds, but it is noted that this may relate to congestion caused by increased traffic in these locations.
- 8.35 Overall, vehicle speed data indicates that speeding has decreased on internal roads, but that boundary roads may see some increased speeding on St. Ann's Road and potentially congestion on West Green Road, both of which will continue to be monitored by the Council.

Bus journey times

- 8.36 Liaison with TfL commenced before the trial scheme went in, with monitoring undertaken of journey time for buses along main boundary road corridors.
- 8.37 Weekly iBus data provided by TfL has been used for analysis on these routes. This gives weekday (Monday to Friday, excluding bank holidays) average journey times by route, stop-to-stop link and peak periods. These journey times exclude dwell times at stops.
- 8.38 The data included in Appendix A2 shows graphs for these key corridors. These indicate weekly journey times (12 hour between 7am-7pm) with baselines (upper, lower and average) provided on what the journey times would be expected under "normal" conditions. Journey times are based on speed of travel of buses, hence showing as time taken to travel a kilometre.
- 8.39 Green Lanes – Bus journey speeds on Green Lanes have fluctuated above and below the baseline standard deviations for both directions of travel. Prior to the introduction of the St Ann's scheme, bus speeds in the northbound direction peak were around 7.5min/km but increased to almost 8min/km after the scheme went live

(although these figures have dropped again since). Southbound speeds have had less fluctuation, with most peaks around 5min/km both prior to the scheme and after the scheme. Journey times seem to have increased following the implementation of the scheme for a short period but, since the start of 2023, have returned to lower levels.

- 8.40 High Road – On High Road, data for both northbound and southbound directions is very similar. Excepting several isolated spikes in journey times, journey speeds are very stable around the average of 5.5min/km for northbound vehicles and between 4 and 4.5min/km for southbound vehicles. There is typically more fluctuation with southbound vehicles, in which the peaks in journey times since the scheme was introduced have been higher than any period previously recorded; however, periods of slow travel are typically resolved within a few weeks.
- 8.41 La Rose Lane – Again, excepting several isolated spikes in journey times, journey speeds on La Rose Lane for northbound and southbound vehicles has remained consistent around the 3.5 to 4min/km mark. Nonetheless, it is evident that, since the St Ann’s scheme was introduced, journey time has decreased to be consistently around 3.5min/km and is regularly lower than this, especially for southbound vehicles. This can be attributed to the traffic filters on La Rose Lane
- 8.42 St Ann’s Road – Bus speeds and times along the St Ann’s Road corridor in both directions have fluctuated significantly throughout the assessed period. For eastbound traffic, there have been spikes in journey times both above (March 2019, August 2020 and March 2023) and below (May/June 2020) the standard deviations for speed, with values ranging from 3 min/km to nearly 6min/km. Westbound traffic has seen similar fluctuations, although since the St Ann’s scheme was implemented, there has been a clearer decrease in bus journey times. Similarly, to eastbound traffic, there was an isolated spike of almost 6.5min/km around March 2023 for westbound traffic.
- 8.43 Seven Sisters Road – On Seven Sisters Road, the data shows a considerable difference in the evolution of bus speeds when comparing the data for northbound and eastbound vehicles. For northbound vehicles, whilst there have been several spikes in journey times, they have remained consistent for the most part within the standard deviations for speed. Contrary to this, for southbound vehicles, there have been fluctuations above and below the standard deviations for speed. Nonetheless, for both northbound and southbound traffic, there has been a clearer increase in bus journey times since the scheme was introduced, with journey times regularly above the baseline upper deviation for speed. Furthermore, northbound traffic has seen more consistent spikes in journey times above 7min/km.
- 8.44 West Green Road - Bus speeds and times along the West Green Road corridor in both directions have fluctuated throughout the assessed period, with eastbound traffic experiencing stronger fluctuations. Prior to the introduction of the St Ann’s scheme, data shows several spikes in journey times for eastbound traffic of 5.5min/km, compared to one spike in journey times for westbound traffic of 5.5min/km. Nonetheless, for both eastbound and westbound traffic, there has been

an increase in bus journey times since the scheme was introduced, with journey times regularly above the baseline upper deviation for speed and a peak of 6.5min/km around November 2022 in both directions.

Air quality

- 8.45 The location of air quality monitoring sites is listed in Appendix E.
- 8.46 Whilst the review point for this experimental scheme is at six months, there is a time delay in obtaining air quality data and as such , only five months of data is available post-implementation, to January 2023. This means that making comparisons between short periods of time before and after scheme implementation is less likely to yield meaningful results, and that presenting air quality data on a site-by-site basis would be incomplete and not statistically significant enough to draw any conclusions.
- 8.47 Instead, based on the above, the overall trend of NO₂ levels (as an average across all site types) has been considered to show how air quality has changed over time.
- 8.48 Appendix A2 provides details of the results of the air quality monitoring. Graph 8: Average NO₂ Levels in St Ann's LTN Compared to Long-Term Borough-Wide Sites from Diffusion Tubes shows:
- the full year air quality data between 2018 and 2022. Therefore, this spans the period of the COVID-19 pandemic when the background patterns were not typical of other years. There are considerable seasonal impacts on NO₂ levels, typically the measured levels of NO₂ are lower in warmer months and higher in colder months.
- 8.49 As can be seen in the chart, there are considerable seasonal impacts on NO₂ levels, with typically lower levels recorded in warmer months and higher levels in colder months. Still, the impact of COVID-19 on air quality was very clear during the most restrictive lockdowns in 2020 and 2021, with lower-than-average NO₂ levels during this period. From around the time LTN-specific monitors were installed in June 2021, COVID-era improvements in air quality began to flatten and, as many returned to work and more active daily routines in 2022, began to increase slightly. Broadly the same trend can be seen for borough wide, non-LTN monitors as for monitors inside the LTN – both before and after the schemes were implemented.
- 8.50 Based on the full calendar year data available at background sites, average NO₂ levels fell from an average 44 µg/m³ in the 2019 peak to 30 µg/m³ in 2021, before increasing slightly to 31 µg/m³ for 2022, a total 30% reduction from peak levels.
- 8.51 LTN sites saw the same trend for 2021/2022 as we see across the borough. i.e. a slight increase in average NO₂ concentrations. However, the LTN sites saw a smaller increase in NO₂ concentrations when compared to the borough wide sites. Roadside sites within the LTN saw a 9.4% increase NO₂ concentrations compared to a 13% increase in the wider borough. Urban Background sites also saw an

increase in NO2 concentrations, with a 6.7% increase at sites within the LTN and 9% increase at sites within the wider borough.

- 8.52 Appreciating that the above is based on a limited dataset with only five months of comparable data, the initial analysis would indicate that the St Ann's LTN is delivering the intended impact of improving the local Air Quality, and that without the implementation of the LTN it is highly likely that the concentrations of NO2 would be comparable to that of the background sites.
- 8.53 At the end of 2023 when a full year's results are available post LTN implementation, accurate annualised and bias adjusted data will provide a more accurate indication of air quality performance for the St Ann's LTN.

Collisions

- 8.54 Road casualty data is available from Transport for London (TfL) who collate road traffic collision data recorded in London by the Metropolitan Police Service (MPS). The latest data available is up to December 2022. Given the very limited data available post-implementation of the trial scheme, no meaningful analysis can be undertaken to draw any conclusions on whether the changes implemented have had a positive or negative impact on road traffic collisions. This data will continue to be monitored and reported when the final decision is taken on the scheme in 2024, by which time a year's data should be available.

Emergency services

- 8.55 Officers liaised with emergency services throughout the engagement phase of the scheme which helped inform the Cabinet decision in December 2021. This included altering some restrictions from physically closed to camera enforced, allowing these services access through the majority of restrictions. Liaison has been ongoing with regular feedback sought from all three emergency services - ambulance, fire and police. Although emergency services are exempt from the 'No Motor Vehicle' restrictions which are camera enforced, ongoing discussions have been helpful to draw out any issues experienced with accessing properties or on response times. Latest feedback received was positive of the way Haringey Council has engaged with emergency services and responding to concerns including granting exemptions to key personnel whose role requires them to attend site post incident. No issues have been highlighted with the trial scheme and its impact on their services.

Crime and anti-social behaviour

- 8.56 Based on the nine months of crime data following from the introduction of the scheme, there is so far no indication that crime patterns within the St Ann's LTN area have changed following the scheme's introduction. The number of criminal activity reports in the scheme area and in the borough-at-large are broadly similar, both before and after the scheme's introduction.

Footfall and high street Mastercard spend

8.57 Appendix D provides graphs showing weekly footfall for the Seven Sisters/ West Green Road district centre for the whole of 2022 and for up to March 2023. The busiest week for footfall in 2022 was week 26 with 164,942 visitors. The lowest footfall in 2022 was week 52 with 108,606 visitors which mirrored other high streets and town centres in the borough. Footfall in week 21 of 2023 is 11.96% higher than week 34 of 2022 – the first week of the St Ann’s LTN; and 12.92% higher than week 44 of 2022 – the first week of the Bruce Grove West Green LTN.

Footfall was higher in 26 of the 40 weeks since the footfall recorded in week 34 (145,744) – the first week of the St Ann’s LTN; and higher in 19 of the 30 weeks since the footfall recorded in week 44 (144,501) – the first week of Bruce Grove West Green LTN

- Week 34 – the first week of the St Ann’s LTN was the lowest week for instore indexed card spend in 2022. Spend was higher in all weeks from 35 of 2022 to week 19 of 2023
- Instore card spend was higher in all weeks from week 44 – the first week of the Bruce Grove West Green LTN, with exception of week 52 of 2022 and week 1 of 2023. This coincided with the Christmas and New Year holidays.

8.58 The graph for Mastercard Spend data from West Green Road shows seasonal fluctuations and again may be impacted also by COVID-19 and the cost-of living crisis. Instore actual card spend is lower in all the 19 weeks to date in 2023 than in 2022 and when adjusted for inflation, index card spend is higher in 17 of the 19 weeks to date in 2023.

8.59 The Council has also launched a boroughwide Haringey Business Survey 2023 and the outcome of this will help inform type of support required.

Feedback – Commonplace survey and map

8.60 The Commonplace exercise for the St Ann’s LTN was carried out between Monday 30th January and Friday 10th March 2023. The results are detailed in Appendix B2.

8.61 3040 residents provided feedback to both the questionnaire and the interactive map: The respondents were asked “How did you feel about the trial LTN scheme before it was launched?”. When the survey respondents were asked about their sentiments about the LTN scheme trial before it was launched, 34.5% suggested they held a positive sentiment about it, compared to over half (52.2%) who had held a negative sentiment.

8.62 Those who had access to a vehicle in their household were more likely to hold negative sentiments (69.3%) compared to those without access to a vehicle (27.6%).

- 8.63 When asked “Based on the trial LTN scheme so far, how do you feel about it?” The majority (65.0%) of respondents reported negative sentiment, while just under a third (31.5%) reported positive sentiment. These findings differed significantly by car access, whereby respondents without access to a car were more likely than those with a car to report positive sentiment (68.2% vs 23.9%). The findings suggest an increase in negative sentiment since the introduction of the St Ann’s LTN.
- 8.64 Looking at what respondents liked most about the St Ann’s LTN, the most commonly cited likes were ‘Reduces through traffic’ (17.5%), ‘The area is now more pleasant’ (16.0%) and ‘Encourages me to walk in the area’ (15.3%). Conversely, the most commonly cited dislikes were: ‘Increases traffic’ (32.1%), ‘Increases air pollution’ (27.2%) and ‘The area is now less pleasant’ (22.1%)’.
- 8.65 When asked what action you want the Council to consider, 849 respondents provided a total of 1,340 comments regarding actions they would like the Council to consider. The most common themes identified from these responses related to ‘Remove the LTN’ (189 responses), ‘Support the LTN’ (171 responses), ‘Congestion/traffic build-up/displacement (132 responses) and modify the LTN (82 responses).

Feedback – emails and portal correspondence

- 8.66 A total of 13 respondents provided 32 comments regarding their views on the LTN. Traffic congestion was the most frequently highlighted issue (six respondents), closely followed by the related theme of increased journey times were highlighted by five respondents. Air quality concerns due to increased traffic was highlighted by four respondents, with the same number suggesting that accessibility across the LTN area for local residents could be improved by providing them exemption from the LTN.

Business Perception Survey

- 8.67 A bespoke survey was undertaken to seek feedback from businesses located inside and on the immediate boundary of the LTNs. The Council commissioned ECF, an engagement consultancy, to undertake this work. This involved the survey company visiting business premises and either completing the survey with them or leaving them with a paper copy of the survey to fill and send back to the Council. The feedback from the respondents in all 3 LTN areas were consistent in the themes expressed.
- Most of the businesses employ less than 5 people in line with the SME business size.
 - Most travel by car/motorbike (38%) followed by public transport (29%), then by walking (24%). Travel to work has seen a majority shift from motor vehicle to walking.

- The number of employees remained the same after the implementation of the LTN.
- Numbers of customers has reduced and respondents attribute this to the introduction of the LTN traffic congestion rather than the cost of living or wider economic downturn.
- Customer's travel mode has experienced a majority shift from motor vehicle to walking since the introduction of the St Ann's LTN

8.68 A total of 443 businesses in St Ann's LTN were visited during May 2023. From these, there were 48 respondents. This represents an 11% response rate. The themes emerging from the results of the survey is similar across all 3 LTNs and the vast majority of businesses employ a maximum of 4 people. Due to the limited number of formal shopping streets in the St Ann's area, the significant feedback from the traders was gained from West Green Road.

8.69 **West Green Road.** There were 21 respondents from West Green Road. From the traders who responded to the business perception survey, 86% reported a decrease in customers in the last 4 months and 68% reported a decrease in turnover since the introduction of the LTNs. It is important to note that West Green Road is at the boundary of the St Ann's LTN and the Bruce Grove West Green LTN. The reduction in customers was attributed to the LTN by 78% of the respondents and the reduction in turnover was attributed to the LTN by 82% of respondents. When asked how customer's mode of travel to the business has changed, respondents indicated a 33% change to walking and a 5% change to bus/ train travel by customers as car travel reduced.

Formal objections

8.70 During the six-month statutory objection period, 631 formal objections were lodged with the Council. The top five themes mentioned in the objections raised are noted below.

1. Congestion/traffic build-up/displacement
2. Air quality concerns
3. Increased journey times
4. Negative impact on business/the economy
5. Road safety concerns

Petitions / deputations

- 8.71 In February 2023, Full Council² received three petitions, two of which are pertinent to this LTN:
- Petition 1. 4238 signatures objecting to the “St Ann’s and West Green LTN”
 - Petition 3. 7528 signatures objecting to “West Green and Bruce Grove LTN”
- 8.72 At the same meeting, a deputation was heard, that specifically related to the boundary between St Ann’s Road and West Green Road and the detrimental effect it was having on the Orthodox Jewish Community. The deputation called upon the LTN to be removed or amend the scheme to relieve the hardship it was causing on local families.

Option appraisal

- 8.73 In response to the interim data collected and the feedback outlined in the previous sections, an Options Appraisal has been carried out, as contained in Appendix C. The risks and benefits of each option are contained within the appraisal.
- 8.74 The following options have been considered:
- Option 1 – Opening La Rose Lane to motor traffic in both directions.
 - Option 2 – Opening any of the four north-south corridors La Rose Lane, Cornwall Rd, Avenue Rd, Woodlands Park Road to motor traffic (which allows different combinations to be considered).
 - Option 3 – Opening La Rose Lane in one direction to motor traffic (either direction).
 - Option 4 – Opening La Rose Lane to motor traffic, outside of school opening and closing times.
 - Option 5 - Move the traffic filter in Avenue Road by junction with Newsam Avenue approximately 10m north. This will result in the removal of 4 resident permit holder bays.

Options recommended for implementation in this report

- 8.75 Having taken account of the risks and benefits of each option and the feedback provided, officers consider that, on balance, and for the reasons summarised below, the following options are implemented under ETOs:
- Option 2 – Avenue Road. relocation of traffic filter further north and changes to parking. This will address a road safety problem of vehicles mounting the footway to bypass the restriction and protect private property.

² <https://www.minutes.haringey.gov.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CIId=143&MIId=10509>

9 Interim review of the Bounds Green LTN

Key dates

- 9.1 The LTN trial came into effect on 15 August 2022 and, in accordance with national statutory provisions 3, can in principle operate for a maximum period of 18 months, i.e., until 15 February 2024.
- 9.2 The launch of the trial also triggered the start of a six-month statutory objection period until 15 February 2023.
- 9.3 In order to enable parking and loading changes noted in paragraph nine point four to be implemented, a new ETO was created for parking, waiting and loading for which the six-month statutory objection period ended on 8 March 2023, and the ETO expires on 8 March 2024. The ETO relating to moving traffic which includes changes to traffic filters and exemptions was unchanged, with the ETO expiry date remaining at 15 February 2024.

Changes made following launch of the trial

- 9.4 Minor changes were made to the design of the LTN, summarised as:
- Amendment to waiting restrictions and parking places in Queens Road and Bounds Green Road to improve access;
 - Amendment to waiting restrictions and parking places in Marlborough Road, Palmerston Road to improve turning space for vehicles servicing shops in Myddleton Road; and
 - Amendments to waiting restrictions in Blake Road, Lynton Gardens, Churston Gardens and Woodfield Way to improve turning space for vehicles.

Traffic volumes and speed

- 9.5 Appendix A3 provides the full detail and analysis of the data captured before (November 2021) and after (January 2023) the trial LTN scheme was implemented. The flows recorded have been adjusted to normalise for COVID-19 disruption between the months in which the counts have been undertaken. Further detail on this is provided in Appendix A3.
- 9.6 **All motorised traffic:** The data for all motorised traffic is provided as a 7-day daily average. In summary, across all monitored internal roads, there were approximately 15,900 fewer vehicles counted post-implementation vs. pre-implementation, equating to an overall 66% drop in volume. On boundary roads, a marginal percentage increase of 7% was recorded, equating to around 6,800 additional vehicles as compared to the pre-implementation counts.

³ <https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukxi/1996/2489/contents/made>

- 9.7 On internal roads, Truro Road and Nightingale Road experienced the largest reductions in traffic flows, which decreased by around 4,900 and 4,300 daily vehicles respectively, differences of -99% and -94% respectively when compared to pre-implementation flows at the same sites. Both roads were filtered, thus resulting in the expected significant drop in traffic volumes. Other roads, including Queens Road, also experienced large percentage decreases in vehicle flows, but without large net changes in traffic volumes.
- 9.8 Overall, most internal roads within the Bounds Green LTN area experienced decreases of at least 50%, with seven roads observing drops of over 500 daily vehicles, in line with the objectives of the LTN to reduce traffic levels on quieter residential roads.
- 9.9 The picture on boundary roads was more varied, although with an overall increase in flows. The most significant increase by both volume and percentage change was experienced on High Road (at Cranbook Park/ Watsons Road), where there were 4,400 more daily vehicles in January 2023 than in November 2021, an increase of 19%. There was also a noticeable increase in daily motorised vehicles on Bounds Green Road (at Truro Road/Nightingale Road), a 16% rise equating to around 3,100 additional vehicles – it is noted that much of this increase was for northbound vehicles.
- 9.10 In contrast to this, some boundary roads experienced a decrease in motorised traffic volumes when compared with the pre-implementation period. The Bounds Green Road site at Gordon Road/Passmore Gardens saw a 2% decrease in motorised traffic, equating to around 350 fewer daily vehicles, with similar impacts seen at the High Road site at Sidney Road/Woodside Road.
- 9.11 Whilst these findings indicate that the total volume of traffic on internal roads has decreased considerably since the Bounds Green LTN trial, some boundary roads have seen increases since implementation and merit further monitoring by the Council. Ultimately, though, there has been a net decrease in motorised vehicle volumes across the scheme area between the pre- and post-implementation periods, indicating that the scheme is delivering on this objective.
- 9.12 **Goods vehicle traffic volumes:** The volume of goods vehicles during weekdays would generally be expected to decrease significantly on internal roads and increase slightly on boundary roads, in line with broader trends for motorised vehicles (although noting motorised vehicle trends above are for full, seven-day weeks).
- 9.13 For internal roads, the volumes of both LGVs and HGVs have decreased by 43% and 63% respectively. However, it is important to note that the proportion of LGVs compared to total motorised vehicles has increased by 4 percentage points, whilst remaining the same for HGVs. For LGVs, this indicates that routing choices may be less flexible than for general traffic, most likely because a higher percentage of LGVs need to drop off or pick up at specific households within the LTN area, whereby general traffic may be able to alter and amend their routes.

- 9.14 For individual internal roads, changes in vehicle flows often translate to large percentage changes (based on low initial volumes), so it is generally more useful to look at changes in actual vehicle numbers. Utilising this metric for LGVs, roads including Nightingale Road (-269 LGVs), Palmerston Road (-196 LGVs), Blake Road (-87 LGVs), and Myddleton Road (-82 LGVs) all saw notable decreases for daily vehicles. Of these, both Nightingale Road and Palmerston Road experienced 82% reductions in the number of LGVs. Furthermore, all LGVs stopped traveling via Truro Road due to the filter here.
- 9.15 In contrast, Ring Way in the northwest corner of the scheme area experienced a large increase in flows (+245 daily LGVs). This area is home to an industrial estate, so the continued prevalence of these vehicles is to be expected.
- 9.16 HGVs comprised a smaller starting proportion of all motorised traffic within the scheme area. As such, the only roads to experience a decrease in HGV volume of over 40 daily vehicles were Ring Way (-137 HGVs), Nightingale Road (-77 HGVs), Gordon Road (-49 HGVs), and Commerce Road (-41 HGVs). The largest increases in HGVs were seen on Cline Road (+42 HGVs) and Myddleton Road (+36 HGVs). As with LGVs, there was a 100% drop in HGVs on Truro Road.
- 9.17 Data for boundary roads has shown more variance, although it is noted following review of the data that survey outputs may have misclassified goods vehicle data in either the pre- or post-implementation collection periods – this can be seen for Durnsford Road, where an 89% increase in LGVs was seen alongside an 89% decrease in HGVs, yet together only calculates to an increase of 4%. A similar issue may exist on High Road at Cranbook Park/Watsons Road, where a 32% increase was seen when summing both LGVs and HGVs. Summing across all boundary sites, then, it appears that total goods vehicle numbers have increased by 9% - which is more or less in line with the trend for other motorised traffic.
- 9.18 **Motorcycle volumes:** As with goods vehicles, it would be expected that motorcycle flows broadly reflect the trends in overall motor vehicle traffic, for example large decreases on internal roads and slight increases on boundary roads.
- 9.19 For internal roads, motorcycle volumes have decreased in most locations, although not to the same extent as general traffic across the two surveyed periods. Despite a 23% drop in motorcycles, which equates to 225 per day when normalised, the proportional representation of motorcycles increased from 4% in November 2021 to 9% in January 2023. This perhaps indicates less flexibility for motorcycles (and motorcycle-based deliveries) than for general traffic in terms of routing options. It may also be a result of motorcycles passing illegally through filters with physical barriers such as bollards, which other motorised vehicles are unable to do.
- 9.20 The most significant decrease in daily motorcycles was on Nightingale Road where a drop of 87 motorcycles equates to a 92% change in volume post-implementation, other notable decreases included Blake Road (-50 motorcycles) and Truro Road (-80 motorcycles). Interestingly, whilst the Truro Road filter has stopped almost all general traffic, it has not stopped all motorcycles, which now account for 95% of all vehicles counted at this site – indicating a level of noncompliance for motorcyclists.

- 9.21 There were increases in motorcycle volume across all boundary roads that were assessed. Overall, this was equal to around 1,100 more motorcycles (+47%) in the post-implementation period. This change was largely driven by increases at the High Road site at Cranbrook Road/Watsons Road, which saw nearly 800 more motorcycles pass per day.
- 9.22 Ultimately, it appears that motorcycle volumes tend to follow the general trend of motorised vehicles (decrease for internal roads and increase for boundary roads) but in both cases show a higher degree of prevalence.
- 9.23 **Cycling volumes:** Cycling levels on a national basis were around 85% during the pre-implementation monitoring period and closer to 80% during the post-implementation period, indicating that there was likely not a significant difference in baseline conditions for cycling between the two periods.
- 9.24 With consideration offered to the findings above, it appears that cycling levels have increased slightly across internal roads within the Bounds Green LTN scheme area between the two monitoring periods, whilst levels have decreased significantly on boundary roads. The post-implementation situation has observed volumes rise by 6% overall on internal roads, an increase of around 40 daily cycles counted, whilst boundary road volumes dropped by 31%, equalling 627 fewer daily cycles post-implementation.
- 9.25 On internal roads, the most notable increase was on Palmerston Road, where daily cycle volumes increased by 142 (393%) – perhaps as this is now an especially attractive north-south route when combined with the North Circular Road crossing installed just before COVID-19. There was also a notable rise in cyclists along Nightingale Road of 58 (+185%), but all other increases were to a much smaller extent in both volume and proportion. There were significant decreases on some internal roads including Ring Way (-82) and Gordon Road (-30).
- 9.26 All boundary roads contributed to the decrease in overall cycling levels, but the largest decreases were along the A105 High Road with the site at (@Cranbrook Park/ Watsons Road) counting 273 less cycles (-25%) than pre-implementation and (@Sidney Road/Woodside Road) recording 224 fewer (-54%). The A105 High Road at this location has seen a significant increase in overall traffic and especially HGVs which may have resulted in this section becoming less attractive to cyclists.
- 9.27 For the other boundary roads, decreases were observed but to a lesser extent than along the A105 High Road. It is unclear if there is a specific reason cycling decreases were seen on these roads, or if this is a larger area trend for boundary roads for the compared months.
- 9.28 **Vehicle speeds:** Overall, vehicle speeds have increased slightly on both internal and boundary roads across the key metrics analysed between the November 2021 pre-implementation and January 2023 post-implementation survey periods, the increases in most cases are negligible and all are less than 10% after the weighted averages are calculated.

- 9.29 On internal roads, there are a wide range of changes for vehicle speeds, although it is noted that the low volumes of traffic on many roads in the post-implementation stage means that values during this stage of data collection are quite easily skewed. Despite this, the data demonstrates that average speeds across internal roads increased by 0.5mph (4%) when compared to pre-implementation values. Increases were seen across a range of sites, although the largest increases in average speed remained fairly moderate at +2.7mph on both Cline Road and Ring Way.
- 9.30 On the other hand, several internal roads experienced significant decreases in average speed post-implementation, with the largest changes seen on Blake Road (-4.3mph), Nightingale Road (-3.8mph) and Palmerston Road (-3.1mph). Of the internal roads in the Bounds Green trial area, Blake Road saw the largest decrease in percentage of vehicles speeding (-31%) and Myddleton Road recorded the largest increase (11%) – despite Myddleton Road only seeing a 1.4mph increase in average speeds.
- 9.31 The situation on boundary roads did not change significantly between November 2021 and January 2023. Overall average speeds increased by 0.4mph (2%) and the percentage of speeding vehicles increased by 6% between the two periods, but for most roads the changes were minimal. The High Road site at Cranbrook Park/Watsons Road saw the most notable increases across this period, where speeds increased by 2.1mph (16%), 85th percentile speeds increased by 3.1mph and, of motorised vehicles, 25% more were recorded as speeding.
- 9.32 Overall, vehicle speed data indicates that vehicle speed metrics on both internal and boundary roads have slightly increased, but analysis tells us that for several internal roads, speeds decreased and on most boundary roads there were no differences observed.

Bus journey times

- 9.33 Liaison with TfL commenced before the trial scheme went in, with monitoring undertaken of journey time for buses travelling along boundary road corridors.
- 9.34 Weekly iBus data provided by TfL has been used for analysis on these routes. This gives weekday (Monday to Friday, excluding bank holidays) average journey times by route, stop-to-stop link and peak periods. These journey times exclude dwell times at stops.
- 9.35 The data included in Appendix A3 shows graphs for these key corridors. These indicate weekly journey times (12 hour between 7am-7pm) with baselines (upper, lower and average) provided on what the journey times would be expected under “normal” conditions. Journey times are based on speed of travel of buses, hence showing as time taken to travel a kilometre.
- 9.36 Bounds Green Road Bus Journey Times: Across the assessed period, bus speeds and times along the Bounds Green Road corridor in both directions have varied considerably, with several notable spikes in journey times. Journey times, particularly for northbound vehicles, tended to be above the pre-COVID range – in

2021 averaging around 4.5min/km, about a minute slower than before the pandemic. Journey times improved slightly up to August 2022, when the scheme was implemented and journey times saw a spike – however, northbound journey times on Bounds Green Road have since returned to pre-COVID averages, whilst southbound journey times are only slightly elevated.

- 9.37 Brownlow Road Bus Journey Times: Average weekday journey times for buses along Brownlow Road have remained quite low and consistent both pre-COVID and across the assessed period, not including two isolated but substantial spikes in August and October 2022 where journey times reached 6min/km. Along the northbound corridor there were more frequent fluctuations, the low in April 2020 was considerably below its standard deviation at 3min/km before then rising to above 5min/km regularly from 2021. Post-implementation journey times tend to be slightly higher than the pre-COVID average for northbound buses and about the same as this average for southbound buses.
- 9.38 Pinkham Way Station Road Bus Journey Times: Along Pinkham Way Station Road, average weekday journey times have improved significantly along the northbound corridor when compared to pre-COVID averages. Bus times peaked at above 8min/km in September 2019 but now remain steadily around 4min/km. There were more regular variations in times for the southbound corridors between a low in March 2021 of 2.5min/km to spikes above 4.5min/km in October 2022 and most recently in April 2023, but journey times are still better than those in 2019 and early 2020.
- 9.39 Bowes Road Bus Journey Times: The situation on Bowes Road has also remained relatively consistent in both directions following the lifting of COVID-19 lockdown restrictions, with average bus journey times remaining below 4min/km for most of the assessed periods. There does not appear to be any impact from the scheme's implementation.

Air quality

- 9.40 Whilst the review point for this experimental scheme is at six months, there is a time delay in obtaining air quality data and as such, only five months of data is available post-implementation, to January 2023. This means that making comparisons between short periods of time before and after scheme implementation is less likely to yield meaningful results, and that presenting air quality data on a site-by-site basis would be incomplete and not statistically significant enough to draw any conclusions.
- 9.41 Instead, based on the above, the overall trend of NO₂ levels (as an average across all site types) has been considered to show how air quality has changed over time.
- 9.42 Appendix A3 provides details of the results of the air quality monitoring. Graph 2 Average NO₂ Levels in Bruce Grove West Green LTN Compared to Long-Term Borough-Wide Sites from Diffusion Tubes shows:
- 9.43 The full-year air quality data between 2018 and 2022. Therefore, this spans the period of the COVID-19 pandemic when the background patterns were not typical

of other years. There are considerable seasonal impacts on NO₂ levels, with typically lower levels recorded in warmer months and higher levels in colder months. Still, the impact of COVID-19 on air quality was very clear during the most restrictive lockdowns in 2020 and 2021, with lower-than-average NO₂ levels during this period. From around the time LTN-specific monitors were installed in June 2021, COVID-era improvements in air quality began to flatten and, as many returned to work and more active daily routines in 2022, began to increase slightly. Broadly the same trend can be seen for borough wide, non-LTN monitors as for monitors inside the LTN – both before and after the schemes were implemented – indicating no specific impact from their introduction.

- 9.44 Based on the full calendar year data available at background sites, average NO₂ levels fell from an average 44 µg/m³ in the 2019 peak to 30 µg/m³ in 2021, before increasing slightly to 31 µg/m³ for 2022, a total 30% reduction from peak levels.
- 9.45 LTN sites, saw the same trend for 2021/2022 as we see across the borough. i.e. a slight increase in average NO₂ concentrations. However, the LTN sites saw a smaller increase in NO₂ concentrations when compared to the borough wide sites. Roadside sites within the LTN saw a 10.5% increase NO₂ concentrations compared to a 13% increase in the wider borough. Urban Background sites saw a 0.8% increase in NO₂ concentrations, a significantly smaller increase compared to the borough wide sites which saw a 9% increase in the same time period.
- 9.46 Appreciating that the above is based on a limited dataset with only five months of comparable data, the initial analysis would indicate that, the Bounds Green LTN is delivering the intended impact of improving the local Air Quality, and that without the implementation of the LTN it is highly likely that the concentrations of NO₂ would be comparable to that of the background sites.
- 9.47 At the end of 2023 when a full year's results are available post LTN implementation, accurate annualised and bias adjusted data will provide a more accurate indication of air quality performance for the Bounds Green LTN.

Collisions

- 9.48 Road casualty data is available from Transport for London (TfL) who collate collision data recorded in London by the Metropolitan Police Service (MPS). The latest data available is up to December 2022. Given the very limited data available post-implementation of the trial scheme, no meaningful analysis can be undertaken to draw any conclusions on whether the changes implemented have had a positive or negative impact on road traffic collisions. This data will continue to be monitored and reported when the final decision is taken on the scheme in 2024, by which time a year's data should be available.

Emergency services

- 9.49 Officers liaised with emergency services throughout the engagement phase of the scheme which helped inform the Cabinet decision in December 2021. This included altering some restrictions from physically closed to camera enforced, allowing these services access through the majority of restrictions. Liaison has been ongoing with regular feedback sought from all three emergency services - ambulance, fire and police. Although emergency services are exempt from the 'No Motor Vehicle' restrictions which are camera-enforced, ongoing discussions have been helpful to draw out any issues experienced with accessing properties or on response times. Latest feedback received was positive of the way Haringey Council has engaged with emergency services and responding to concerns including granting exemptions to key personnel whose role requires them to attend site post incident. No issues have been highlighted with the trial scheme and its impact on their service.

Crime and anti-social behaviour

- 9.50 Whilst there are only six months of crime data following from the introduction of the scheme, there is so far no indication based on the data that crime patterns within the Bounds Green LTN area have changed following the scheme's introduction. The number of criminal activity reports in the scheme area and in the wider borough are broadly similar, both before and after the scheme's introduction.
- 9.51 The Council will continue to monitor this metric to see if any changes are reflected over time as the scheme further beds-in.

Footfall and high street Mastercard spend

- 9.52 Appendix D provides graphs showing weekly footfall in Myddleton Road for the whole of 2022 and for up to March 2023. This shows footfall is impacted by changing seasons and more recently likely also by COVID-19 and cost-of-living crisis. The busiest week for footfall in 2022 was week 20 where 9,731 visitors were registered. The lowest week for footfall in 2022 was Christmas week 52 with 4,829 visitors. This matches the trends in other high streets and town centres across the borough.
- 9.53 A second graph is also provided in Appendix D. This shows Mastercard indexed spend data per week for Myddleton Road from week 1 of 2022 to week 19 of 2023. Instore indexed card spend was higher in 18 of the 39 weeks since week 33 of 2022 – the first week of the Bounds Green LTN. Comparing weeks 1 to 19 in 2022 before the LTN implementation with the same period in 2023.
- 9.54 A year-on-year comparison of Mastercard spend amounts per week between 2019 and 2023 shows indexed instore actual card spend is higher in 17 of the 19 weeks to date in 2023 than in 2022, with spend in weeks 11 and 15 lower than the comparable weeks in 2022. However, when adjusted for inflation, indexed card spend is higher in 14 of the 19 weeks to date in 2023. However, it should be noted that pre-pandemic numbers of transactions are statistically lower than post-

pandemic due to the increased number of people now using card as the preferred payment method.

- 9.55 When comparing Myddleton Road - Instore Indexed Spend Amounts with comparable local centres, it shows that Myddleton Road has an historically lower spend than all other high streets and town centres across the borough. Whilst the local centres are of similar size, it is difficult to compare like for like across local centres and high streets due to varying demographics. The fluctuations of spend show the individuality of each local centre.

Feedback – Commonplace survey and map

- 9.56 The Commonplace exercise for Bounds Green LTN was carried out between 20th December 2022 and 31st January 2023. The results are summarised in Appendix B3. 3125 residents provided feedback to both the questionnaire and the interactive map.
- 9.57 Respondents were asked about their feelings towards the trial LTN scheme before it was launched, with the majority (55.6%) reporting negative sentiment, and just over a quarter (26.1%) reporting positive sentiment.
- 9.58 These findings differed significantly by age, car ownership, and between respondents with different relationships to the area. Those aged 16-24 age were least likely to report positive sentiment compared to all other age groups (6.5% vs 27.7%); with those aged 75+ most likely to be positive (32.4%).
- 9.59 Those without access to a car were more likely to view the LTN scheme positively (56.7%) compared to those who have access to a car (22.5%). Those who do not work in Haringey (39.4%), visit shops and businesses within the LTN (30.9%) or on boundary roads (30.5%) most likely to hold positive sentiments before the LTN launched.
- 9.60 After the implementation of the Bounds Green LTN, respondents were asked how they feel about the trial LTN scheme so far, nearly three quarters of respondents (74.7%) reported negative sentiment, while just under a quarter (22.8%) reported positive sentiment.
- 9.61 The overall results indicate a reduction in positive sentiment overall compared to prior to the LTN launch. These findings differed significantly by car access, whereby respondents without access to a car are more likely to view the LTN scheme positively (54.0%) compared to those who have access to a car (19.6%). The types of respondents who were most likely to report positive sentiments were those who do not work in Haringey (42.3%), visit shops and businesses within the LTN (29.0%) or on boundary roads (28.2%). Again, the findings suggest an increase in negative sentiment since the introduction of the LTN.
- 9.62 When asked what action you want the Council to consider, 577 respondents provided a total of 844 comments regarding actions they would like the Council to consider. Opinion at this question was polarised, with the most common theme

being 'Remove the LTN' (194 responses), followed by 'Support the LTN' (118 responses), congestion (81 responses) and Modify the LTN (62 responses).

Feedback – emails and portal correspondence

- 9.63 A total of 65 comments were provided across the online portal feedback and representations regarding views towards the LTN. The most common theme among these comments were in relation to air quality concerns, traffic congestion and displacement, and suggestions to remove the LTN.
- 9.64 Common concerns regarding air quality were related to increased pollution at the boundary area of the LTN, often linked to sentiments regarding increased journey times. Several respondents suggested that after the introduction of the LTN, traffic congestion has significantly increased, with Bounds Green Road being reported as the most impacted.
- 9.65 Respondents who suggested to remove the LTN entirely often did so on the basis that they felt the LTN was contributing to increased levels of traffic, increased air and noise pollution, and increased journey times.

Business Perception Survey

- 9.66 A bespoke survey was undertaken to seek feedback from businesses located inside and on the immediate boundary of the LTNs. The Council commissioned ECF, an engagement consultancy, to undertake this work. This involved the survey company visiting business premises and either completing the survey with them or leaving them with a paper copy of the survey to fill and send back to the Council. The feedback from the respondents in all 3 LTN areas were consistent in the themes expressed.
- Most of the businesses employ less than 5 people in line with the SME business size.
 - Most travel by car/motorbike (38%) followed by public transport (29%), then by walking (24%). Travel to work has seen a majority shift from motor vehicle to walking.
 - The number of employees remained the same after the implementation of the LTN.
 - Numbers of customers has reduced and respondents attribute this to the introduction of the LTN traffic congestion rather than the cost of living or wider economic downturn.
 - Customer's travel mode has experienced a majority shift from motor vehicle to walking since the introduction of the Bounds Green LTN.

- 9.67 A total of 446 businesses in the Bounds Green LTN were visited during May 2023. From these, there were 95 respondents. This represents a 21% response rate. The themes emerging from the results of the survey is similar across all 3 LTNs and the vast majority of businesses employ a maximum of 4 people. Due to the limited number of formal shopping streets in the Bounds Green area, the significant feedback from the traders was gained from Myddleton Road.
- 9.68 **Myddleton Road.** There were 20 respondents from Myddleton Road. From the traders who responded to the business perception survey, 100% reported a decrease in customers in the last 4 months and 95% reported a decrease in turnover since the introduction of the LTNs. The reduction in customers was attributed to the LTN by 100% of the respondents and the reduction in turnover was attributed to the LTN by 95% of respondents whereas 5% stated the economic down-turn. When asked how customer's mode of travel to the business has changed, respondents indicated a 10% change to walking as car travel reduced.

Formal objections

- 9.69 During the six-month statutory objection period, 828 formal objections were lodged with the Council.
- 9.70 The top five themes highlighted in the objections received are:
1. Congestion/traffic build-up/displacement.
 2. Air quality concerns.
 3. Increased journey times.
 4. Negative impact on business/the economy.
 5. Disproportionate effects/discrimination associated with LTNs.

Petitions / deputations

- 9.71 In February 2023, Full Council⁴ received three petitions, one of which is pertinent to this LTN
- Petition 2. 2837 signatures objecting to the "Bounds Green LTN"

Options appraisal

- 9.72 In response to the interim data collected and the feedback outlined in the previous sections, an Options Appraisal has been carried out, as contained in Appendix G. The risks and benefits of each option are contained within the appraisal.
- 9.73 The following options have been considered:

⁴ <https://www.minutes.haringey.gov.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CIId=143&MIId=10509>

- Option 1 – Myddleton Road. Alternative traffic flow (creating two cells each accessed from either Bounds Green Road or Green Lanes/ High Rd) through introduction of a diagonal traffic filter on Myddleton Road at junction with Marlborough Road. (This would require removal of a traffic filter at Marlborough Road and relocating a filter on Whittington Road)
- Option 2 – Opening Myddleton Road and Whittington Road to motor traffic (This would require removal of a traffic filter on Whittington Road and potential changes to other traffic filters)

Options recommended for implementation in this report

9.74 Having taken account of the risks and benefits of the option outlined in 9.67 and the feedback provided, officers consider that, on balance, this option is not recommended.

10 Contribution to the Corporate Delivery Plan 2022-2024 high-level strategic outcomes

10.1 Low Traffic Neighbourhoods are specifically identified within the ‘Responding to the Climate Emergency’ theme of the Corporate Delivery Plan, under the following high level strategic outcome:

- A Greener and Climate Resilient Haringey: Reduced through traffic leading to safer, cleaner and more pleasant streets for people to walk, wheel, cycle and gather.
- A Low Carbon Place: it is expected that LTNs will help achieve a built environment that supports carbon reduction – through transport modal shift - and climate adaptation – through the planting of street trees.

11 Statutory Officer Comments

Finance

11.1 The total cost of delivering the recommendations is expected to be approximately £40,000. The costs will be funded from the approved General Fund capital programme.

11.2 The purpose of LTNs is not to generate income for the Council and all fines received and costs incurred are used by the Council, in accordance with the requirements of Schedule 2 to the Local Authorities and Transport for London Act 2003. It is expected that the changes proposed to the ETO’s in this report will lead to a revised pattern of compliance and reduce the need for the Council to use its enforcement powers.

Strategic Procurement

- 11.3 SP note the contents of the report and recommendations in section 3 and that they are not related to a procurement matter.

12 Head of Legal & Governance

- 12.1 Section 9 of the Road Traffic Regulation Act 1984 (“RTRA”) allows for the making of experimental traffic orders (“ETOs”) restricting or prohibiting use of a road or part of one by particular types of vehicles or pedestrians, which may not last longer than 18 months and may be continued from time to time during the period of up to 18 months from the date the order first came into force.
- 12.2 When exercising its functions under the RTRA the Council must under section 122(1) so far as practicable have regard to the matters specified in subsection (2) to secure the expeditious, convenient and safe movement of vehicular and other traffic (including pedestrians) and the provision of suitable and adequate parking facilities on and off the highway.
- 12.3 The “matters specified” in subsection (2) are (1) the desirability of securing and maintaining reasonable access to premises; (2) the effect on the amenities of any locality affected and (without prejudice to the generality of this paragraph) the importance of regulating and restricting the use of roads by heavy commercial vehicles, so as to preserve or improve the amenities of the areas through which the roads run; (3) the strategy prepared under section 80 of the Environment Act 1995 (national air quality strategy); (4) the importance of facilitating the passage of public service vehicles and of securing the safety and convenience of persons using or desiring to use such vehicles and (5) any other matters appearing to the local authority to be relevant”.
- 12.4 Section 122 of the RTRA involves a balancing exercise that has involved the Council’s officers having in mind the section 122(1) duty, having regard to factors pointing in favour of imposing a restriction on that movement (as discussed in this report), balancing the various considerations and coming to the conclusion that the recommendations in this report represent the appropriate outcome The factors which have pointed in favour of imposing a restriction on that movement have included the objective of reducing pollution and carbon emissions, improving health outcomes, reducing collisions and reclaiming neighbourhood streets for pedestrians.

12.5

The Council as a local traffic authority must also under section 16(1) of the Traffic Management Act 2004 manage its road network with a view to achieving, so far as may be reasonably practicable having regard to their other obligations, policies and

objectives, the objective of securing the expeditious movement of traffic, including pedestrians, on the Council's highway network and facilitating the expeditious movement of traffic, including pedestrians, on road networks for which another authority is the traffic authority.

- 12.6 Section 16(2) of the 2004 Act refers to action which the authority may take in performing the network management duty. This includes any action which will contribute to the more efficient use of the road network to secure the expeditious movement of traffic, including pedestrians, on the Council's highway network, which implementing the changes to the ETOs will achieve.
- 12.7 There is no requirement to consult the general public before an ETO is made like there is for a permanent traffic order, but where the ETO may affect passage along any road the Council must consult such other organisations (if any) representing persons likely to be affected by any provision in the order as the order making authority thinks it appropriate to consult.
- 12.8 Although these ETOs are not being made permanent, because the ETOs are not being made permanent as there would not be sufficient time to consider any objections received in respect of any modified ETOs made to give effect to the changes proposed to the exemptions in this report before the ETOs expire, the objections received regarding the ETOs have been considered by officers as set out in sections 7, 8 and 9 of this report and have been attached in Appendix B1, B2 and B3 for members to note.
- 12.9 An ETO must be genuinely experimental in nature - an operation designed to glean information about the workings of a scheme in practice, which it is considered the new ETOs will be as the ETOs needed to the modified for the proposed changes to be assessed before a decision is made to make the same permanent.
- 12.10 The exercise of the power contained in section 9 to make ETOs is an executive function which can be exercised by Cabinet in accordance with the Council's Constitution.

13 Equality

- 13.1 The Council has a Public Sector Equality Duty under the Equality Act (2010) to have due regard to the need to:

- Eliminate discrimination, harassment and victimisation and any other conduct prohibited under the Act
- Advance equality of opportunity between people who share those protected characteristics and people who do not
- Foster good relations between people who share those characteristics and people who do not.

13.2 The three parts of the duty applies to the following protected characteristics: age, disability, gender reassignment, pregnancy/maternity, race, religion/faith, sex and sexual orientation. Marriage and civil partnership status applies to the first part of the duty.

13.3 In 2021, the three Phase 1 LTN's were subject to individual EqIA's (Bruce Grove West Green⁵, St Ann's⁶, Bounds Green⁷) as part of the LTN decision (Appendix I to the three reports) which assessed the likely impacts of the proposed LTN's and that of complementary measures on groups with protected characteristics as defined by the Equality Act. The EQIA's, and the Cabinet report which contained a summary of the findings, identified the following:

- Age: Children are particularly at risk from road danger and air pollution - LTNs have been shown to improve air quality. Walking is most frequently used mode for Londoner's over 65 however schemes changing motor vehicle access could have a negative impact on older people who may be able to walk or cycle less, however local amenities and homes remain accessible in an LTN although some rerouting may be required
- Disability: LTNs reduce road danger and improve ability to cross streets by reducing traffic – high risk groups, such as those people with a disability, are likely to benefit. Those with a disability who rely upon a motor vehicle may need to re-route or experience some variance in journey times however mitigation is made through provision of exemptions for blue badge holders living within or on the boundary of the LTN
- Sex: Women frequently travel as pedestrians, so pedestrian-friendly LTNs are expected to make walking more comfortable for this group. Women are more likely to be primary carers for children and those who rely upon motor vehicles may be required to re-route or experience variance in journey time. However, as people change to alternative modes of transport (resulting in less congestion) it assists those who are reliant upon motor vehicles.

⁵ <https://www.minutes.haringey.gov.uk/documents/s128376/Appendix%20I%20Bruce%20Grove%20West%20Green%20EQIA.pdf>

⁶ <https://www.minutes.haringey.gov.uk/documents/s128410/Appendix%20I%20St%20Anns%20EQIA.pdf>

⁷ <https://www.minutes.haringey.gov.uk/documents/s128391/Appendix%20I%20Bounds%20Green%20EQIA.pdf>

- Gender reassignment: Unlikely to unduly impact
- Marriage and civil partnership: Unlikely to unduly impact
- Religion or believe: Unlikely to unduly impact
- Race: a high proportion of black, Asian and ethnically diverse residents make sustainable transport journeys (walking and bus trips) therefore the reductions in road danger and increased pedestrian priority delivered through the LTN will broadly benefit these groups. Black, Asian and ethnically diverse Londoners (adults and children) are twice as likely as white Londoners to be injured on the roads. With significantly reduced traffic volumes on minor roads, these groups are likely to benefit. Areas with higher proportions of BAME residents are adequately engaged in relation to the trial
- Sexual orientation: Unlikely to unduly impact
- Pregnancy and maternity: Action to reduce motor vehicle reliance will help address motor traffic pollution and better protect pregnant women and unborn children. Recognition that some women may need to travel by motor vehicle (including buses) and the LTN may cause some variance in journey terms in the short term. However, in the medium to longer term, reduction in traffic congestion will favour those who need to make essential trips by motor vehicle or bus.

- 13.4 As such, the LTN measures were considered to advance equalities for many protected groups. The EqIA's also identified potential negative impacts for those reliant on motor vehicles for transport whose journeys may be different or take longer. These impacts have been mitigated so far through the granting of exemptions for residents to pass through filters under particular, limited circumstances.
- 13.5 The recommendations contained within Section 3 of this report are considered to be consistent with the EqIA summarised above because the changes are fine-tuning the operation of the scheme, in order to deliver on its overall aims which remain the same and were the subject to previous equalities analysis. The advantages and disadvantages of the scheme, for different groups with protected characteristics, remain the same and are based upon the medium-long term benefits expected by the schemes.
- 13.6 The changes in this report are, in many parts, led by feedback provided to date for each individual LTN (see Appendix B1, B2 and B3 and the three 'Option Appraisal' sections within this report). Further consultation will be carried out if the changes are approved, allowing everyone the opportunity to give feedback for a further six months.
- 13.7 It is noted that as a part of proposed changes to the LTN exemptions process, authorised in a separate decision, the EqIA which refers to that process is being updated. The proposed new exemptions process shall further lessen the impact of the LTN on persons with a blue badge who are reliant on a motor vehicle, by

permitting more and easier access to LTN areas other than the one in which they reside. This will have a positive equalities impact.

14 Use of Appendices

- Appendix A1 – Monitoring Data for Bruce Grove West Green LTN
- Appendix A2 – Monitoring Data for St Anns LTN
- Appendix A3 – Monitoring Data for Bounds Green LTN
- Appendix B1 – Feedback for Bruce Grove West Green LTN
- Appendix B2 – Feedback for St Ann’s LTN
- Appendix B3 – Feedback for Bounds Green LTN
- Appendix C – Business Perception Survey Results
- Appendix D – Footfall and Mastercard Spend Data
- Appendix E – Air quality monitoring sites
- Appendix F – Plan of existing trial schemes
- Appendix G – Options appraisal
- Appendix H – Plan of proposed changes for Bruce Grove West Green LTN
- Appendix I1 – Updated Equality Impact Assessment for Bruce Grove West Green LTN
- Appendix I2 - Updated Equality Impact Assessment for St Ann’s LTN
- Appendix I3 - Updated Equality Impact Assessment for Bounds Green LTN

15 Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985

- [7/12/2021 Cabinet: Bruce Grove West Green LTN](#)
- [7/12/2021 Cabinet: St Ann’s LTN](#)
- [7/12/2021 Cabinet: Bounds Green LTN](#)
- [Corporate Delivery Plan 2022/23 and 2023/24](#)